

Women in Anomaly Communication of Religious Development in Indonesia: Study in Yogyakarta

Hasan Sazali, Chuzaimah Batubara, Nurasih
State Islamic University of North Sumatra
North Sumatra, Indonesia
hasansazali@uinsu.ac.id

Abstract—Religious counselors have an important role in religious development in Indonesia, as well as in Yogyakarta. Religious counselors in Yogyakarta are currently dominated by male. As a result, there are many inappropriate religious counseling materials given on the context of women in the dimensions of life. The same matter applies to the number of congregations who become the focus of those religious counselors in conveying messages about religious development. Most of these congregations have female members, thus usually gather to discuss women-related issues. The research was conducted by a qualitative approach using critical and statistical analysis. The results show that there is substantial content of religious education materials indicated to have a gender bias both in the religious approach and in social life. Therefore there is a need for the government to conduct gender reinforcement studies for religious instructors in strengthening the context of religious development in Indonesia while still paying attention to the local wisdom of local communities.

Keywords—women; religious instructor

I. INTRODUCTION

Religious development is a strategic issue in national development in Indonesia. The position of religion in the development contestation is very urgent when religion is used as the spirit of values in development for the government as well as society. Lubis (2010) in Sazali (2016) explains that the philosophy of development in Indonesia is the realization of a just and prosperous society based on Pancasila and the 1945 Constitution. The just and prosperous society can be realized if all citizens believe in the Almighty God. The mention of the Almighty God is intended to make inclusive understanding so that the understanding of the plurality of society is directed to the formation of cosmopolitan multiculturalism awareness. This awareness has fused in various traditions or local wisdom that enable them to interact across tribes, cultures, and religions.

The policies of religious development in Indonesia have two main bases, namely the ideal and instrumental foundation. The ideal foundation is the aspiration of Indonesia's independence battle which is formulated in the five foundations of Indonesia summarized in Pancasila. Pancasila begins with the universal obligation of every human being that his existence is the gift of God Almighty (Sazali, 2016). To realize this policy, the role of religious instructors both male and female is very important in religious development in Indonesia, including those in the city of Yogyakarta. Since the field of religious counseling is dominated by male counselors, they much outnumber the female ones. However, when conveying religious development messages in the community, they tend to do it through female congregations. Due to this gender-based difference in terms of male-dominated religious counselors and female-dominated congregations, there is a strong gender bias in the substance of the material and approach in the delivery when conveying religious development material related to human issues in the dimensions of social life.

Related to this issue, the researchers conducted a longitudinal study from 2014 to 2017 regarding the role of women in religious development in the city of Yogyakarta and reported it in this paper with the title "Anomalies of Women in the Communication of the Development of Religion in Indonesia Study of Yogyakarta City" There are some questions that the researchers aimed to address in this study:

1. What is the role of female religious counselors in the communication of religious development in the city of Yogyakarta?
2. What are the material substances and the approaches used by the religious counselors in communicating religious development in Yogyakarta?
3. What factors influence religious counselors in the material substance of religious development communication material in Yogyakarta?

Based on the background of the study and the formulation of the problem explained previously, the purposes of the study are as follows:

1. To analyze the role of female religious counselors in religious development communication in Yogyakarta.

2. To analyze the material substances and the approaches used by the religious counselors in communicating religious development in Yogyakarta.
3. To identify the factors that influence religious counselors in the material substances of religious development communication the city of Yogyakarta.

The method used in this research is descriptive analytical with a qualitative method approach. The technique of data collection was carried out in triangulation (combination), inductive data analysis in which the results emphasize more on 'meaning' instead of 'generalization.'

II. METHOD

In this research, the researchers used a case study approach. A case study is a research strategy through which a researcher carefully investigates a program, event, activity, process, or a group of individuals (Creswell, 2010 p. 20). A case study is a strategy that is more suitable if the subject matter or research investigating 'how' or 'why' when the researcher has few opportunities to control the events that will be investigated, and when the focus of his research lies on contemporary phenomena within real-life context (Yin, 2015). To gain more complete data so that it is more comprehensive in several characteristics, the statistical perspective quantification of the findings of the data obtained from the field was quantified.

Some studies related to the role of women in development, including in the religious sector, which can be used as a reference in this paper include: David, Roberta (1999) Writing about "Gender Inequality, Income, and Growth: Are Good Times Good for Women" Most women are not involved in development in developing poor countries, this factor begins in the world of education, causing women to be less involved in development. Killian, Bernadeta (2011) Writing about "The Woman's Land Rights Movement, Customary Law and Religion in Tanzania" Describes, religious relations with social change related to gender relations and justice. In principle, in the country of Tanzania, which carries out the law in a plural way by using various kinds of approaches in implementing the law. However, sometimes religion can accelerate the progress of civilization, on the other hand, it can hamper progress in the social system of society. Farré, Lidia. (2012) Writing about "The role of men in the economic and social development of women implication for gender equality" Explains, about how man's behavior influences gender behavior in the social system. The strong influence of men both as husbands and as fathers in the social system is related to social dynamics without exception in economic and health aspects in development. Regarding writing or research that discusses the anomalies of women in religious development communication in Indonesia, there is no case study in the city of Yogyakarta that has done so both in substance and approach. The position of previous research in this study can be used as an approach to analyzing the findings obtained in this study.

III. FINDING AND DISCUSSION

The importance of seeing a gender perspective in development is basically based on several reasons. First, there is an awareness of equal rights between men and women to participate in development. Second, women are perceived as the majority in the poor, even the poorest in the poor. Therefore, in the process of development, women suffer far more than men do. All of them have access from the patriarchal community structure. Third, women have a strategic role in the development process starting from their role in the family and social environment. Fourth, women are considered to play an important role in breaking the poverty chains of the next generations (Winarno, 2013).

During the New Order era of the Indonesian government, women in development were brought into the value of modernization that was oriented towards productivity, efficiency, and rationality as happened in industrialized countries. In this case, women are only seen as figures who only understand the context of healthy and nutritious food, are skillful at working and able to educate children in a modern and rational manner and manage family financial management well.

However, such idealization has led women to social alienation, due to the heavy dual role that they get in the social system of society. This condition seems to be well structured in the Women's Corps (Darma Wanita) which can be found in various government agencies and private institutions. The roll-out continued in Indonesia until the current era. Likewise, with the religious development sector, this involves more men as actors driving religious development in Indonesia. This phenomenon also takes place in Yogyakarta as the location of this study. In terms of the structure of the population, the city is dominated by women.

The demographic conditions of the city of Yogyakarta above are based on two population data, from the Population and Civil Registry Service to see the population 'de jure' and from the Yogyakarta City Central Bureau of Statistics (BPS) in a 'de facto' manner. The population of a region is influenced by birth, death and migration / population movements. The population growth of Yogyakarta City is changing every year. The changes are much influenced by migration. However, this population problem, especially migration, is not well organized which causes its own social problems to the city of Yogyakarta. Moreover, it is publicly known that the city has its own appeal to those who want to study, so this area is inhabited by high schoolers and

university students who come from almost all corners of the country, some even from abroad. So that it is not uncommon for migrants to have their own problems, especially in social adaptation with the local people (Sazali, 2016).

TABLE I. THE COMPOSITION OF POPULATION OF YOGYAKARTA BASED ON GENDER

No	Districts	Male	Female	M + F
1	TEGALREJO	18.030	18.775	36.805
2	JETIS	13.339	14.198	27.537
3	GONDOKUSUMAN	20.282	21.595	41.877
4	DANUREJAN	10.527	10.871	21.398
5	GEDONGTENGEN	10.084	10.586	20.630
6	NGAMPILAN	9.258	9.672	18.930
7	WIROBRAJAN	13.632	14.275	27.907
8	MANTRIJERON	17.217	17.942	35.159
9	KRATON	10.860	11.376	22.236
10	GANDOMANAN	7.422	7.860	15.282
11	PAKUALAMAN	5.184	5.690	10.874
12	MERANGSAN	15.560	16.551	32.111
13	UMBULHARJO	33.222	34.249	67.651
14	KOTAGEDE	16.452	16.851	33.303
	TOTAL	201.069	210.631	411.700

Source: Population and Civil Registry Service Yogyakarta (2016)

According to the data from the Population and Civil Registry Service, the population of the city of Yogyakarta based on the number of religious followers at this time is amounting to 413936 people, the majority of whom converted to Islam. The number of followers of Islam in 2014 was 341548. The composition of the population of the city of Yogyakarta based on religion can be seen in table 2 below:

TABLE II. THE COMPOSITION OF POPULATION IN YOGYAKARTA CITY BASED ON RELIGION

No	Districts	Religion (Followers)						
		Muslim	Christian	Catholic	Hindu	Buddhist	Konghucu	Others
1	Tegal Rejo	29941	3117	3794	36	73	4	1
2	Jetis	20941	2718	4073	23	171	12	1
3	Gondokusuman	32266	5499	4982	114	125	2	5
4	Danurejan	17723	1380	2337	20	73	3	2
5	Gedongtengen	16148	1743	2902	32	228	3	2
6	Ngampilan	15998	1068	1645	41	89	0	0
7	Wirobrajan	25503	1188	3970	37	62	1	0
8	Mantrijeron	29709	1432	4363	34	79	0	2
9	Kraton	19066	626	2786	22	1	0	1
10	Gondomanan	11274	1763	2115	14	243	0	0
11	Pakualaman	8476	682	1625	32	33	0	0
12	Mergangsan	26966	1987	2933	61	65	1	2
13	Umbulharjo	59784	2885	4793	72	98	0	0
14	Kota Gede	30753	907	1106	27	22	0	0
	Total	341548	26995	43424	565	1362	26	16

Source: Population and Civil Registry Service Yogyakarta (2014)

Sazali (2016) Based on the table above, the composition of the female population is more than that of male one and of the total population, the majority is Muslims. With the population of 413936 religious followers, the Ministry of Religious Affairs Yogyakarta has 32 religious counselors scattered throughout the subdistricts in the city of Yogyakarta, where the duty of religious counselors is to foster the lives of religious people. The Ministry of Religious Affairs Yogyakarta has set some religious development targets which include increased understanding and experience of religion as well as harmonious, dynamic, and internal inter-religious tolerance within the government. The number of religious counselors in Yogyakarta can be seen in the table below:

TABLE III. RELIGIOUS COUNSELORS OF YOGYAKARTA

No	Name	Working Unit
1	Nur Akhmad,S.Ag.,M.A.	Islamic Counselor in Ngampilan
2	Kusmanto,S.Ag	Islamic Counselor in Umbul Harjo
3	Hj.Rita Maisyaroh,S.Ag	Islamic Counselor in Mantrijeron
4	Sutarjo,S.Ag.,MA	Islamic Counselor in Kota Gede
5	Muntholib	Islamic Counselor in Pakualaman
6	Aminuddin,S.Ag,M.Si	Islamic Counselor in Tegal Rejo
7	Karmin,S.Ag	Islamic Counselor in Mergangsan
8	Muhammad Makhiani,S.Ag	Islamic Counselor in Jetis
9	Fahrur Rozi,Sthi	Islamic Counselor in Gondokusuman
10	Suryana,S.Ag	Islamic Counselor in Gedongtengen
12	Arini Nurhayati,S.Ag	Islamic Counselor in Keraton
13	Janti Ristiani,S.Ag	Islamic Counselor in Gondomanan
14	H.Solehudin,S.Ag	Islamic Counselor in Umbulharjo
15	Samsul Ma`arif,S.Thi	Islamic Counselor in Danurejan
16	Muhammad Da`i, S.Ag	Islamic Counselor in Wiroberajan
17	Suprpto,S.Ag	Islamic Counselor in Mantrijeron
18	Margianto,S.Ag	Islamic Counselor in Tegalrejo
19	Suhartanto,S.Ag	Islamic Counselor in Gedongtengen
20	Muchrimah,S.Ag	Islamic Counselor in Kotagede
21	Siti Da`imah,S.Ag	Islamic Counselor in Tegalrejo
22	Eko Agus Wibowo,S.Sos.I	Islamic Community Counselor in the City of Yogyakarta
23	Mujiarto,S.Sos.I	Islamic Counselor in Mergangsan
24	Eman Suherman S.Pd.I	Islamic Counselor in Gondomanan
25	Endro Dwi Widodo,S.Ag	Islamic Counselor in Wiroberajan
26	Solihat,S.HI	Islamic Counselor in Gondokusuman
27	Felicitas Maria Fadhari.S.Ag	Catholic Counselor in the City of Yogyakarta
28	Carolus Baromeus Ismulyadi,SS	Catholic Counselor in the City of Yogyakarta
29	Erica Evi Yanti,S.PAK	Christian Counselor in the City of Yogyakarta
30	Tri Didik Wibowo Adi,M.Th	Christian Counselor in the City of Yogyakarta
31	Totok,S.Ag	Buddhist Counselor in the City of Yogyakarta
32	Agus Tri Harjo Purnomo,S.Ag	Islamic Counselor in the City of Yogyakarta

Source: The Ministry of Religious Affairs Yogyakarta (2015)

The religious counselors in the city of Yogyakarta were mostly holding bachelor's degrees (S1), out of 32 counselors, 28 bachelor graduates and 4 are master graduates. Those with bachelor's degrees were majoring in Islamic law (Faculty of Sharia and Islamic Law) while religious counselors are expected to graduate from Faculty of Islamic Da'wah and Communication,

majoring in Islamic Counseling and Communication. Technically, the researchers analyzed a lot of obstacles in the process of delivering the messages of development conveyed by the religious counselors, not to mention the issue of their competence of the messages to be delivered (Sazali, 2016) as the profession of religious counselors in Yogyakarta is still dominated by men, with them amounted to 71.88% of the total number of counselors. This condition should basically be the government's attention to see the level of success effectiveness of religious instructors' role in the field. The results of observations that researchers conducted in observing the objective conditions of religious counselors, most of them dealt with more women than men as members of the community who were counseled. Thus, it is very difficult for religious counselors to deliver development messages, let alone something related to development information. In addition to government institutions such as correctional facility (prisons), the offices of government agencies, essentially religious counselors directly deal with the community. Cultural construction towards the existence of female religious counselors cannot be separated from the process of their performance in the field.

TABLE IV. LEVELS OF EDUCATION OF RELIGIOUS COUNSELORS IN YOGYAKARTA CITY

Level of Education	Total (Person)	Percentage (%)
S1	28	87,5
S2	4	12,5
Total	32	100

Source: The Ministry of Religious Affairs Yogyakarta City (2015)

TABLE V. GENDER OF RELIGIOUS COUNSELORS IN YOGYAKARTA CITY

Gender	Total (Person)	Percentage (%)
Men	23	71,88
Women	9	28,12
Total	32	100

Source: The Ministry of Religious Affairs Yogyakarta City (2015)

Basically, women have a very significant contribution to the success of development programs, as well as aspects of religious development. Referring to the development goals of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) proclaimed by the United Nations (UN), it is reminded of the importance of women's involvement in development (Njoh, Akiwumi, 2011).

In the life of the people of Yogyakarta, religious counsel delivered by male religious counselors conveying the issues of male and female relations and the context of domestic life according to religious teachings, it is often found that women have no option but to submit and obey their partners, moreover this condition is strengthened in the order of life of Javanese people, where women must have a gentle, compassionate nature, as depicted in the figure of Dewi Subhadra (Partini, 2013). The dimensions of Dewi Subadra's figure in a deeper impression are neglected, such as a strong, intelligent woman and so on. This wrong perception is reinforced by the understanding of the sources of religious teachings that are still misinformed by some male religious counselors through the message of putting forward obedience to men (husband) which must be done by a wife. There is an unwritten belief that the area of a woman to get a reward in religious teachings only deals with domestic problems.

The problem now is, if in religious teachings, especially in Islam, the role of women is so high and respectable where the only difference in the eyes of Allah is the level of one's piety, in reality, the delivery of religious counseling material that took place in the city of Yogyakarta sends a message as if women occupy the second class in the social system of society, whose job is only as a place to produce continuity of offspring. This condition is reinforced by the stigma of society that the figure of a woman must be fertile and can give birth to many offspring. If there is a family that does not get the offspring, the one to blame is always the wife, even though it is not always like that. The problem could come from the husband. This condition seems to be a construction that is always conditioned in the name of religious teachings.

In the position of this study, women's suffering of women as the development projects continues, especially in the aspect of the development of the mentality of religious life and gender perspective. Community structures that have been built with patriarchal ideology always benefit men, especially in the context of religious counseling which is always conveyed by male religious counselors. As if this condition was approved by some women, especially those living in the city of Yogyakarta. Various problems in our society, especially in the city of Yogyakarta which is the focus of the findings in this study, such as the treatment in getting justice. This marginalization occurs because of the strong stereotypes against women. A gender-biased view that has implications for people's lives.

Violence against women has been increasing from year to year. According to the researchers, there is something that is not working well regarding aspects of religious development. For the context of the City of Yogyakarta, religious counseling materials rarely include material on violence against women which is formulated in positive law that is associated with religious teachings in religious counseling material. This condition continues where religious counselors are mostly men. Violence against women is very vulnerable, either physical, verbal or sexual violence, especially sexual violence. A husband who forces sexual

intercourse with his wife cannot be subjected to rape. Article 285 of the Indonesian Criminal Code states that "Anyone who by violence or by the threat of violence forces a woman to have sex with her outside of marriage is threatened for committing rape with a maximum imprisonment of 12 years" Therefore, rape is only valid if the victim is not the wife of the perpetrator. In other words, the husband's rape is not an act of crime (Lilijawa, 2010: 46). Whereas in Islamic teachings, it is stated "And they (wives) are appropriate. Then if you do not like them, (then be patient) because you may not like something, even though Allah makes it a lot of goodness" The Qur'an (An Nisa, 4:19).

Klingorova, Havlicek (2015: 2) explained, "The position of women in society is very diverse, many factors influence the occurrence of gender inequality, one of which is the interpretation of a false concept of religious teachings." In the behavior of everyday life, the false interpretation has been the practical guide in humans' daily life. In addition to religious teachings, the contribution of cultural values has also contributed to gender inequality and has subordinated the role of women in society.

This condition is not much different from the women in the city of Yogyakarta in the context of religious development communication. There is a very strong bias in the gender perspective in conveying the messages of religious development related to improving the quality of human empowerment, in this case, is women. Likewise with female religious counselors, sometimes they also get treatment that indicates a gender bias both in the household and in the work environment. The image of women workers, in the city of Yogyakarta, both the views of the male and female groups themselves must have a good image in the eyes of society. For female workers, this good image means they can balance their work and household life perfectly. If one fails, the image of the woman who works becomes disgraceful in the eyes of the community. The blame often makes women not confident to develop their potential even further. Therefore, to maintain a good image of women in the eyes of the community, sacrifice is needed that is neither small nor easy.

In another perspective, the image of women who work is good in the eyes of the family, because they are considered to be able to help with household life. This condition indirectly lifts the degree of family economy. This condition is different from men who do not have multiple demands, related to the work they are engaged in; they are not required to get involved directly or indirectly in taking care of domestic work. In family responsibility according to social norms, women have more concern in supporting their families, ranging from their children, husbands, to parents, so that those with jobs have more concern than men in the family's economic system.

The religious counseling carried out by female religious instructors in the city of Yogyakarta still revolves around the issue of worship, which sometimes a lot of the religious counseling material reduces the strategic role of women in development. The religious counseling material carried out by female religious instructors is as follows:

TABLE VI. MATERIAL FOR EXTENSION OF WOMEN'S RELIGION IN THE CITY OF YOGYAKARTA

No	Material for Extension of Women's Religion
1	Role of a Wife in a Home
2	Patterns of Child Education According to Islamic Law
3	Women's Fiqh
4	Worship Practices on the Fasting Month

Source: The Ministry of Religious Affairs Yogyakarta City (2015)

The religious counseling material that is always delivered in one year according to the following percentages:

TABLE VII. PERCENTAGE OF WOMEN'S RELIGIOUS COUNSELING MATERIALS IN YOGYAKARTA CITY

No	Material for Extension of Women's Religion	Percentage (%)
1	Role of a Wife in a Home	25 %
2	Patterns of Child Education According to Islamic Law	33 %
3	Women's Fiqh	32 %
4	Worship Practices on the Fasting Month	10 %
	Total	100 %

Source: The Ministry of Religious Affairs Yogyakarta City (2015)

Sultana (2011) argues that patriarchal ideology is a major obstacle in the development of women's progress. Despite the difference in the level of dominance in social status, where men remain in control. This condition is exacerbated by the legitimacy of religion which is understood by some men in justifying what they do in relation to the relationship between men and women in the social system. Tracing the patriarchal ideology of traditionalists, they believe that men are born to dominate women who always become subordinates in the context of the social system, they believe that this hierarchy continues to exist. It becomes a big challenge for the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia through its religious counseling institutions, to reduce the delivery of material, religious messages that are indicated to have a gender bias, moreover the material of religious messages that is contrary to the values of the teachings of Islam. It is time for the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia

to make an acceleration of formulation related to the material as well as religious counseling workers so that it becomes a concern in the balance between men and women towards the existence of religious counselors in the midst of society.

IV. CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the study, there are several conclusions that can be formulated, including:

- 1) The factor of domination of male religious counselors has provided a bias in the gender perspective in the delivery of religious counseling material in Yogyakarta City.
- 2) Erroneous interpretation in understanding the substance of religious teachings, namely the Qur'an, as the primary source in the delivery of religious counseling material, has led to a wrong perception of society in understanding the position of women and men in the social system.
- 3) The strong influence of culture in giving a legitimation of religious teachings, so as to give an error to the position of women in the community system
- 4) The Government through the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia must accelerate in reducing the content of religious counseling material indicated to have a gender bias. Thus it gives a strong influence on religious development in the aspect of Indonesian human mentality development which has implications in the economy of society.

REFERENCES

- Bahiej, A. (2003). Tinjauan Yuridis atas Delik Perzinahan (Overspel) dalam Hukum Pidana Indonesia. *Jurnal SOSIO-RELIGIA*, 2(2).
- Creswell J.W. (2010). *Research Design, Qualitative, Quantitative, Mixed Methods Approaches*, edisi Terjemahan, *Research Design, Pendekatan Kualitatif, Kuantitatif, dan Mixed*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Kementerian Agama RI. (2010). *Perencanaan Program dan Anggaran Departemen Agama*.
- Klingorova, K., & Havlicek, T. (2015). *Religion and gender inequality: The status of women in the societies of world religions*, Moravian Geographical Reports, Department of Social Geography and Regional Development, Faculty of Science, Charles University in Prague, Czech Republic, p. 2.
- Lilijawa, I. (2010). *Perempuan, Media dan Politik*. Ledalero, Flores.
- Lubis, M.R. (2010). Kebijakan Pembangunan Agama di Indonesia Dalam Lintasan Sejarah. *Jurnal Harmoni*, IX(34). Puslitbang Kehidupan Keagamaan Badan Litbang dan Diklat Kementerian Agama RI, pp. 21-40.
- Njoh, J.A., & Akiwumi, F.A. (2011). The Impact of Religion on Women Empowerment as a Millennium Development Goal in Africa. *Journal Springer Science+Business Media B.V.* 2011, p. 2.
- Okon, E.E. (2012). Religion, Culture and Communication. *American Journal of Social Issues & Humanities*, 2(6), pp. 433-440.
- Partini (2013). *Bias Gender Dalam Birokrasi*. Yogyakarta: Tiara Wacana.
- Sazali, H. (2016) *Penguatan Toleransi Agama dalam Komunikasi Pembangunan Agama, Studi Kasus Pemerintah Kota Bogor dan Yogyakarta*. *Dissertation*. Yogyakarta, Counseling and Communication Development Program. The Graduate School of Universitas Gadjah Mada.
- Servaes, J. (1999). *Communication for Development One World, Multiple Cultures*. Cresskill, Hampton Press.
- Soetomo. (2008). *Strategi Pembangunan Masyarakat*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Sultana, A. (2011). Patriarchy and Women's Subordination: A Theoretical Analysis. *The Arts Faculty Journal*. July 2010-June 2011, p. 1.
- Winarno, B. (2013). *Etika Pembangunan*. Yogyakarta: CAPS (Center For Academic Publishing Service).
- Yin. K.R. (2015). *Studi Kasus Desain dan Metode*, Cetakan ke 14. PT. Raja Grafindo Persada, Jakarta.