

Social Justice in the Welfare of Private Lecturers: A Legal Review of Salaries, Certification, and BPJS Ketenagakerjaan in Indonesia

**Arifuddin Muda Harahap¹, Hisam Ahyani², Miftakhul Huda³, Naeli
Mutmainah⁴, Naelul Azmi⁵, Sérgio António Neves Lousada⁶**

¹Universitas Islam Negeri Sumatera Utara, Indonesia, Email: arifuddinmudaharahap@uinsu.ac.id

²Institut Miftahul Huda Al Azhar, Indonesia, Email: hisamahyani@gmail.com

³Institut Agama Islam Faqih Asy'ari Kediri, Indonesia, Email: okemiftakhul@gmail.com

⁴Lembaga Riset & Inovasi, Yayasan As-Syaeroji, Indonesia, Email: naelimutmainah77@gmail.com

⁵Institut Miftahul Huda Al Azhar, Indonesia, Email: Azmibanjar92@gmail.com

⁶Universidade da Madeira, Funchal, Portugal, Email: slousada@staff.uma.pt

Abstract

This article discusses the issue of the welfare of private lecturers in Indonesia from a legal perspective, focusing on three main aspects: salaries, certification, and social security through BPJS Ketenagakerjaan. In the context of social justice, this study identifies the challenges faced by private lecturers related to the provision of salaries that are not in accordance with the Regional Minimum Wage (UMR), delays in lecturer certification, and the lack of adequate social protection through BPJS Ketenagakerjaan. This study uses a qualitative approach by interviewing lecturers at various private universities in Indonesia, spread across 5 provinces (West Java, Central Java, East Java, North Sumatra, and Bengkulu) and in 12 cities/regencies. The total campuses that are the objects of this study are 24 private universities, consisting of universities, institutes, and colleges. Legal analysis is carried out on existing regulations related to lecturer welfare. The results of the study show that although there are regulations governing the welfare of lecturers, inconsistent implementation has caused injustice felt by many private lecturers. This article suggests the need to revise and strengthen legal regulations to ensure the rights of private lecturers in Indonesia are fulfilled, in order to achieve equitable welfare.

Keywords: *Employment Agreements, Legal Protection, Welfare, Normative Juridical Approach, Private Higher Education.*

1. INTRODUCTION

The welfare of private lecturers in Indonesia is a critical issue that requires attention. Many private lecturers face challenges such as salaries below the Regional Minimum Wage (UMR), delays in certification, and limited access to social security, particularly BPJS Ketenagakerjaan. These issues affect both their quality of life and the quality of education provided. Despite various regulations aimed at improving welfare, inconsistent implementation leads to widespread injustice. This study aims to analyze the welfare of private lecturers in Indonesia from a legal perspective, focusing on salary, certification, and BPJS Ketenagakerjaan. It also explores the factors causing welfare injustice and evaluates how legal regulations can better protect private lecturers' rights.

The problem addressed in this study is to assess the welfare conditions of private lecturers regarding salary, certification, and BPJS, identify causes of welfare inequality, and examine the effectiveness of current legal regulations in supporting their rights. The goal is to provide a comprehensive analysis of legal barriers to fair welfare and offer recommendations for improving regulations. The study adopts a qualitative approach, using in-depth interviews with lecturers from 24 private universities across five provinces and 12 cities. The data will be analyzed to uncover challenges and gaps in the welfare system for private lecturers.

Although ministerial regulations are lower than Government Regulations (PP) or Laws (UU), the principle of *lex specialis derogat legi generali* (special provisions override general ones) applies. Laws such as Law No. 14 of 2005 on teachers and lecturers, and Government Regulation (PP) No. 37 of 2009 concerning Lecturers, guide welfare policies. Additionally, Law No. 13 of 2003 on Employment clarifies workers' rights, employers' obligations, and employment agreements, which are crucial for improving the welfare of private lecturers.

Research on worker welfare, including that of private lecturers in Indonesia, has been explored by various scholars. Aprilia and Wibawa studied wage subsidy policies during the COVID-19 pandemic, emphasizing the need for economic protection,¹ while Dananjaya et al. highlighted inequalities in the social security system affecting both formal and informal workers.² Agustanti et al. analyzed workers' rights during the pandemic, revealing challenges in securing fair wages and social protection.³ Other research by Retnowulandari et al. focused on the social impacts on workers' welfare,⁴ while Hariyanto and others explored legal challenges like the Job Creation Law's impact on worker welfare.⁵ These insights align with the concerns of private lecturers in Indonesia regarding salaries, certification, and BPJS Ketenagakerjaan.

This body of research also includes analyses by Aulia Rahman et al., who discussed the conditions of digital platform workers,⁶ and Siti Kunarti et al., who examined outsourcing and worker protection.⁷ Studies by Maskur Ali et al. and Suwinto Johan et al. dealt with worker rights issues, such as employment termination and birth certificate sanctions, relevant to the broader labor context.⁸ Further, research by Marwanto et al.

1 Nadhiva Putri Aprilia and Kadek Cahya Susila Wibawa, "Prospectus of Salary/Wage Subsidy Policy for Worker Welfare Improvement During Covid-19 Pandemic," *Jurnal IUS Kajian Hukum Dan Keadilan* 9, no. 3 (December 10, 2021), <https://doi.org/10.29303/ius.v9i3.899>.

2 Kadek Agus Sudiarawan et al., "Formulation of Online Dispute Resolution in Realizing Fair Industrial Relations Dispute Settlement: A Comparative Study," *Jurnal IUS Kajian Hukum Dan Keadilan* 12, no. 2 (August 12, 2024): 227–48, <https://doi.org/10.29303/ius.v12i2.1308>.

3 Rosalia Dika Agustanti, Yuliana Yuli Wahyuningsih, and Satino Satino, "Guarantee Of Worker Rights During The Covid 19 Pandemic," *Jambura Law Review* 3, no. 0 (May 1, 2021): 77–95, <https://doi.org/10.33756/jlr.v3i0.7914>.

4 Wahyuni Retnowulandari et al., "The Prevalence Of Child Marriage: Comparitive Study Of Indonesia And Other South Asian States," *Jambura Law Review* 6, no. 2 (July 24, 2024): 339–66, <https://doi.org/10.33756/jlr.v6i2.24257>.

5 Hariyanto, "Risk-Based Business License and Problems Arising After The Job Creation ACT," *Jurnal IUS Kajian Hukum Dan Keadilan* 10, no. 2 (August 23, 2022): 354–66, <https://doi.org/10.29303/ius.v10i2.1082>.

6 Rofi Aulia Rahman, Jozsef Hajdu, and Valentino Nathanael, "Digital Labour Platformer's Legal Status and Decent Working Conditions: European Union and Indonesian Perspective," *Volksgeist: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum Dan Konstitusi*, 2024, <https://doi.org/10.24090/volksgeist.v7i1.10366>.

7 Siti Kunarti et al., "The Legal Politics of Outsourcing and Its Implication for the Protection of Workers in Indonesia," *Sriwijaya Law Review* 8, no. 1 (January 31, 2024): 1–19, <https://doi.org/10.28946/slrev.Vol8.Iss1.2750>. pp1-19.

8 Ali Maskur et al., "Optimizing Legal Protection: Addressing the Disparity of Sanctions Regarding Personal Names in Birth Certificates as Population Documents," *Volksgeist: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum Dan Konstitusi*, June 1, 2024, 21–33, <https://doi.org/10.24090/volksgeist.v7i1.10521>; Suwinto Johan and Luo Yuan Yuan, "What Does Financial Institution Termination of Employment Mean in Terms of Labor Law?," *Volksgeist: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum Dan Konstitusi*, June 28, 2023, 49–59, <https://doi.org/10.24090/volksgeist.v6i1.6372>.

explored international trade law, providing valuable perspectives on worker protections.⁹ In addition, studies by Dhiaulhaq AR examined job creation and environmental protection,¹⁰ while Widi Astuti et al. explored law enforcement related to innocent passage in Indonesian waters.¹¹ Other scholars, including Syahrul Mucharom et al., discussed subsidy agreements,¹² and Suryani Hamzah emphasized living wage policies.¹³ Ridwan Arifin et al. provided a comparative analysis of corruption eradication,¹⁴ while Ros Vickers et al. contributed insights into natural resource laws and regional authority impacts on worker rights.¹⁵ Irma Suryani et al. focused on domestic violence reform,¹⁶ and Surya Hartati explored economic rights in the creative economy.¹⁷ This study, specifically addressing private lecturers' welfare, covers five provinces in Indonesia, offering an in-depth legal analysis of challenges related to salaries, certification, and BPJS Employment.

This study uses a qualitative approach to examine the work agreements of permanent lecturers in private universities in Indonesia.¹⁸ Data were collected through in-depth interviews with lecturers and campus officials from 24 private universities spread across five provinces: West Java, Central Java, East Java, North Sumatra, and Bengkulu. The interviews involved lecturers from various backgrounds, experiences, and fields of study, as well as campus officials to gain a deeper understanding of their perceptions and experiences related to work agreements, legal protection, and lecturer welfare.¹⁹ This study employs two methodological approaches: a normative juridical approach to examine relevant laws, such as Law No. 14 of 2005 and Law No. 40 of 2004, and an empirical legal approach combining secondary legal materials with primary data from in-depth interviews.²⁰ Conducted in West Java, Central Java, East Java, North Sumatra, and

9 Marwanto et al., "Business on Nickel Downstreaming with China and European Union Lawsuits," *Jurnal IUS Kajian Hukum dan Keadilan* 12, no. 2 (August 29, 2024): 315–29, <https://doi.org/10.29303/ius.v12i2.1381>.

10 Muhammad Irfan Dhiaulhaq Ar and Dodik Setiawan Nur Heriyanto, "Striking A Balance Between Job Creation and Sustainability: The Need to Establish A True Environmental Protection Authority in Indonesia," *Jambe Law Journal* 7, no. 1 (May 31, 2024): 1–23, <https://doi.org/10.22437/home.v7i1.317>.

11 Eka Widi Astuti et al., "Legal Enforcement Of Innocent Passage Implementation In Indonesian Waters," *Jurnal IUS Kajian Hukum Dan Keadilan* 7, no. 2 (August 6, 2019): 282–92, <https://doi.org/10.29303/ius.v7i2.660>.

12 Rully Syahrul Mucharom et al., "WTO Subsidies Agreement on Fisheries (2022-2024): Agreed Terms and Implications for Indonesia," *Jurnal IUS Kajian Hukum Dan Keadilan* 12, no. 2 (August 28, 2024): 285–99, <https://doi.org/10.29303/ius.v12i2.1394>.

13 Any Suryani Hamzah, "Strengthening The Relationality of Heteronomous and Autonomous Legal Rules in Workers' Decent Wage Law Policies (An Attempt to Create a Dignified Tripatrid Ecosystem)," *Jurnal IUS Kajian Hukum Dan Keadilan* 11, no. 2 (August 25, 2023), <https://doi.org/10.29303/ius.v11i2.1241>.

14 Ridwan Arifin, Rodiyah Rodiyah, and Pitria Puspita, "A Comparative Analysis of Indonesia's KPK and Hong Kong ICAC in Eradicating Corruption," *Jambe Law Journal* 2, no. 2 (2019): 163–79, <https://doi.org/10.22437/jlj.2.2.163-179>.

15 Ros Vickers, "The Regulation of Natural Resources Law in Australia for Indigenous People," *Jambe Law Journal* 2, no. 2 (2019): 99–117, <https://doi.org/10.22437/jlj.2.2.99-117>.

16 Irma Suryani et al., "Reformulation of Bundo Kandung's Role in Solving Domestic Violence Cases," *Jambura Law Review* 5, no. 2 (May 31, 2023): 199–219, <https://doi.org/10.33756/jlr.v5i2.19172>.

17 Dwi Surya Hartati and Nely Herlina, "Utilization of Economic Rights in Music and Song Works as A Pillar of Creative Economy," *Jambe Law Journal* 1, no. 1 (July 9, 2018): 115–33, <https://doi.org/10.22437/jlj.1.1.115-133>.

18 Matthew Mitchell, "Analyzing the Law Qualitatively," *Qualitative Research Journal* 23, no. 1 (September 9, 2022): 102–13, <https://doi.org/10.1108/QRJ-04-2022-0061>; Naeli Mutmainah et al., "Religious Moderation Approach through Islamic Family Law and Siyasah Fiqh: Challenges of the Digital Era in Banjar City, West Java, Indonesia," *Jurnal Munakahat* 1, no. 1 (December 24, 2024): 11–21; Zakiyyu Muhammad and Yogi Triswandani, "Zakat and Marketing: Innovative Approaches to Enhance Zakat Distribution in Jigawa State, Nigeria," *Jurnal Munakahat* 1, no. 1 (December 12, 2024), <https://ejournal.kampusalazhar.ac.id/index.php/JMK/article/view/17>.

19 Nanang Naisabur et al., "The Prohibition of Social E-Commerce on TikTok Shop: A Fiqh Examination Based on Sharia Compliance and Economic Justice," *Al-Manahij: Jurnal Kajian Hukum Islam*, March 25, 2024, 59–78, <https://doi.org/10.24090/mnh.v18i1.9674>; Naeli Mutmainah et al., "Maqāṣid Al-Sharī'ah in the Digital Era: Challenges in Islamic Family Law and Halal Lifestyle in Indonesia," *Jurnal Munakahat* 1, no. 1 (December 12, 2024), <https://ejournal.kampusalazhar.ac.id/index.php/JMK/article/view/17>.

20 Hisam Ahyani, Memet Slamet, and Tobroni, "Building the Values of Rahmatan Lil 'Alamin for Indonesian Economic Development at 4.0 Era from the Perspective of Philosophy and Islamic Economic Law," *Al-Ihkam: Jurnal*

Bengkulu, the interviews explore lecturers' experiences with employment agreements, legal protection, and welfare. Using content analysis, the study aims to identify patterns and provide insights into how these agreements impact lecturers' professional and personal lives, ultimately contributing to better policies and practices for their welfare in private universities.²¹

2. ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION

2.1 Salary Inequality of Private Lecturers in Indonesia

One significant issue identified in the interviews was the salary disparity among private university lecturers in Indonesia, with many reporting that their salaries did not meet the regional minimum wage (UMR). Lecturers from universities in areas such as Tasikmalaya, Medan, Ciamis, and Cilacap highlighted that their compensation was below the UMR standard, affecting their social and financial well-being. To make ends meet, some lecturers were forced to take on additional jobs, such as becoming lawyers or teaching at other universities. This situation was observed across several institutions, including UMB in Tasikmalaya,²² and INU in Ciamis, where lecturers relied on external income sources to meet their daily needs.²³

In the context of labor law theory,²⁴ this issue highlights a failure in the protection of workers' rights, particularly the right to fair and adequate compensation. According to *Undang-Undang No. 13 Tahun 2003 on Employment*, workers, including lecturers, are entitled to compensation that meets the standards of living, reflected in the UMR. The theory of labor law stresses the importance of employers fulfilling their obligations,²⁵ which include providing equitable wages, ensuring job security, and offering benefits that contribute to the overall well-being of employees.²⁶ Thus, the salary disparity faced by lecturers illustrates a failure in the effective implementation of these laws, resulting

Hukum & Pranata Sosial 16, no. 1 (June 27, 2021): 111–36, <https://doi.org/10.19105/al-lhkam.v16i1.4550> > ; Agus Munjirin Mukhotib Lathif, Andrey Kotyazhov, and Aliyeva Patimat Shapiulaevna, "Protecting Family Integrity from Digital Fraud: Islamic Family Law and ITE Law in WhatsApp Groups," *Jurnal Munakahat* 1, no. 1 (December 24, 2024): 44–54; Muhammad Safdar Bhatti, Rizki Maulana, and Imron Hamzah, "Legal Politics in Transforming Islamic Norms in Sexual Violence Law: A Maqasid al-Shariah Analysis," *Jurnal Munakahat* 1, no. 1 (December 24, 2024): 33–43.

²¹ Michael Anthony C. Dizon, "Socio-Legal Study of Technology: A Norms and Values Approach to Hack-ing and Encryption Law and Policy," *Computer Law & Security Review* 52 (April 1, 2024): 105958, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clsr.2024.105958>.

²² Interview and Data Collected from Mrs. E.N.L., S.Sy., M.H., as a Lecturer at UM, Tasikmalaya Regency, West Java, on July 15, 2024., n.d.

²³ Interview and Data Collected from Mr. U.I.M., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at INU C, West Java, on July 5, 2024., n.d.

²⁴ Brian Langille, "Labour Law's Theory of Justice," in *The Idea of Labour Law*, ed. Guy Davidov and Brian Langille (Oxford University Press, 2011), 0, <https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199693610.003.0008>; Faradila Hasan et al., "Grounding Shariah through the Flexi-Parenting Approach to Achieve Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in Family Life," *Jurnal Munakahat* 1, no. 1 (December 24, 2024): 67–79; Ending Solehudin et al., "Legal Uncertainty in Indonesia's Mining Sector: Impact on Business, Inheritance, and Asset Division Challenges," *Jurnal Munakahat* 1, no. 1 (December 24, 2024): 55–66.

²⁵ Anna Luisa C. Guevarra et al., "Employees' Preference Analysis on Lean Six Sigma Program Coaching Attributes Using a Conjoint Analysis Approach," *Heliyon* 9, no. 7 (July 1, 2023): e17846, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e17846>; Indra Utama Tanjung, Mhd Syahnan, and Akmaluddin Syahputra, "Political and Legal Reconstruction of the Urgency That Forces the Issuance of PERPPU in Indonesia Based on Fair Benefit Values," *Pena Justisia: Media Komunikasi Dan Kajian Hukum* 23, no. 3 (December 19, 2024): 1065–79, <https://doi.org/10.31941/pj.v23i3.5495>; Hisam Ahyani, "Integrating Shariah Principles in Modern Family and Economic Life for Social Well-Being and Justice," *Jurnal Munakahat* 1, no. 1 (December 24, 2024): 79–89.

²⁶ Fahmi Kamuli, Tunggul Anshari, and Istislam Istislam, "Regional Head's Authority In Determining Mutation Of Government Employees," *Jambura Law Review* 3, no. 1 (2021): 37–54, <https://doi.org/10.33756/jlr.v3i1.7520>; Ali Azouz, Nicolas Antheaume, and Brigitte Charles-Pauvers, "An Ethnography of Fairness Perceptions among Non-Family Employees: Does Religion Matter?," *Journal of Family Business Strategy* 12, no. 3 (September 1, 2021): 100375, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfbs.2020.100375>.

in social and financial challenges for the affected workers. This issue of low wages is further compounded by additional challenges, such as the long certification process and the lack of adequate benefits, as noted in many universities, including UPPB in Medan, where lecturers face long waiting times for certification.²⁷

Several factors contribute to salary discrepancies among lecturers, including the heavy reliance of private universities on foundation funding, making it difficult to offer adequate salaries. Many lecturers also lack housing allowances and other benefits, worsening their financial challenges. This issue was reported by lecturers in institutions such as UMB in Tasikmalaya, UNA in Cilacap,²⁸ UIB in Cirebon,²⁹ INU T in Ciamis,³⁰ IAI F in Kediri,³¹ STAI MT,³² and UMB in Medan, where the absence of these allowances forces faculty members to seek additional income through other jobs or entrepreneurial activities.

From a welfare policy perspective, both institutions and the state play a crucial role in ensuring that lecturers' needs go beyond basic compensation, including fair wages, housing allowances, and health coverage. The lack of these benefits at private universities reflects a gap in the welfare system. Many lecturers, such as those at STIT AF in Pangandaran, face financial insecurity despite their qualifications due to insufficient support.³³ Salary disparities are worsened by financial limitations at private universities, which struggle to meet compensation regulations, forcing lecturers to seek additional income through other teaching roles or side jobs, as seen at IKH in Sukabumi.³⁴

This situation emphasizes the need for stronger regulatory enforcement and institutional support to ensure fair compensation for lecturers, as outlined in social justice theory.³⁵ The lack of proper enforcement continues to undermine lecturers' well-being and the quality of education. Lecturers at institutions like IAI Pare Kediri and STIT L in Ciamis have expressed frustration over the absence of basic benefits, such as housing allowances.³⁶ To address these challenges, a reevaluation of private university funding models is necessary, with greater institutional investment and government support to ensure lecturers receive fair compensation and benefits, as seen in the cases at UIB,³⁷ and STAI AF Cicalengka.³⁸

27 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. I.U.T., S.H., M.H., as a Lecturer at UPPB, Medan City, North Sumatra, on July 10, 2024, n.d.

28 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. D.P., M.Pd.I., as a Lecturer at UNA, Cilacap, Central Java, on July 18, 2024, n.d.

29 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. D.A., M.H., as a Lecturer at UIBB, Cirebon, West Java, on July 20, 2024, n.d.

30 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. H., S.Sy., M.H., as a Lecturer at INU T, West Java, on July 8, 2024, n.d.

31 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. M.H., M.H., as a Lecturer at IAI F, Kediri, East Java, on July 12, 2024, n.d.

32 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. D.S., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at STAI MT, West Java, on July 25, 2024, n.d.

33 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. I.H., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at STIT AF, West Java, on July 28, 2024, n.d.

34 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. Z.Z., M.Ag., as a Lecturer at IKH, Sukabumi City, West Java, on July 15, 2024, n.d.

35 Nur Putri Hidayah, Quincy R. Cloet, and David Pradhan, "The Implementation of Labor Development Principles According to Job Creation Law as a Reason to Protect Wages Rights," *BESTUUR* 9, no. 1 (August 12, 2021): 68–76, <https://doi.org/10.20961/bestuur.v9i1.49252>.

36 Interview and Data Collected from Mrs. P.F., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at STIT L, Ciamis, West Java, on July 10, 2024, n.d.

37 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. A.S., S.Ag., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at UIB, Bandung City, West Java, on July 22, 2024, n.d.

38 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. H.M.P., M.H., as a Lecturer at STAI AF, Cicalengka, Bandung, West Java, on July 12, 2024, n.d.

2.2 Challenges in the Lecturer Certification Process

A major issue for many private university lecturers in Indonesia is the prolonged and inefficient certification process, which delays their access to additional income. Lecturers from cities like Medan and Cilacap reported long waiting times for certification, which hinders career advancement and affects their financial stability. For example, lecturers from UM Tasikmalaya, UPPB Medan, UIBB Cirebon, and INU Cirebon had to take on extra jobs, such as becoming lawyers or teaching at other universities, to support their families.³⁹ This situation is worsened by salaries that remain below the regional minimum wage (UMR). The delay in certification is seen as a violation of lecturers' rights under Law No. 14 of 2005, which aims to provide professional recognition and improved earnings. Lecturers from institutions like IAIF, IKH, IMHA,⁴⁰ and STAI MT have expressed how the backlog in certification causes financial stress and blocks career progression.⁴¹

The inefficiency in the certification process presents both financial and professional challenges for lecturers. Many, including those at STAI BA,⁴² STAI DAM,⁴³ and STESy Bengkulu,⁴⁴ face delays that prevent career advancement despite their qualifications. This lack of progression impacts job satisfaction, morale, and increases burnout. Additionally, lecturers from UNA Cilacap and IAIHP Kediri expressed frustration over the absence of housing allowances and BPJS Ketenagakerjaan, essential social protections that are often missing in private universities. The slow certification process, combined with financial constraints at institutions like IAI KHS and UI C, forces lecturers to take on additional jobs or side businesses to meet their financial needs. Lecturers from UNUP,⁴⁵ and INU T emphasized the need for a faster certification process to relieve financial pressure and improve career opportunities. A more efficient certification mechanism would not only alleviate financial burdens but also contribute to lecturers' career development, which is crucial for their welfare. Addressing these challenges within the framework of labor law and welfare policy is essential for ensuring fair compensation, career advancement, and overall job satisfaction for private university lecturers.

The welfare policy theory,⁴⁶ stresses that career development and professional stability are crucial components of an individual's overall well-being.⁴⁷ When lecturers are unable

39 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. U.I.M., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at INU C, West Java, on July 5, 2024.

40 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. M.S.H., S.Pd., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at IMHA, West Java, on July 20, 2024, n.d.

41 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. D.S., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at STAI MT, West Java, on July 25, 2024.

42 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. U.H., S.H.I., M.H., as a Lecturer at STAI BA, Ciparay, Bandung, West Java, on July 15, 2024., n.d.

43 Interview and Data Collected from Mrs. D.F., S.Ag., S.H., M.E.Sy., as a Lecturer at STAI DAM, Garut, West Java, on July 25, 2024., n.d.

44 Interview and Data Collected from Mrs. D.N., S.E.I., M.Ak., M.E., as a Lecturer at STESy NU, Bengkulu City, Bengkulu Province, on July 6, 2024, n.d.

45 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. A.S., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at UNUP, Banyumas Regency, Central Java, on July 30, 2024, n.d.

46 Robert E. Goodin, *Reasons for Welfare: The Political Theory of the Welfare State* (Princeton University Press, 1988), <https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctv173f05w>; Nurlaila Harun et al., "The Transformation of Elopement: From Social Stigma to Practical Solution: A Comparative Study of Elopement Practices Among Indonesian Youth," *Kawanua International Journal of Multicultural Studies* 5, no. 2 (December 29, 2024): 255–70, <https://doi.org/10.30984/kijms.v5i2.1250>; Hisam Ahyani, "Protecting Yourself from Online Fraud and Hacking: An Islamic Perspective," *Abdurrauf Journal of Islamic Studies* 3, no. 3 (October 4, 2024): 171–80, <https://doi.org/10.58824/arjis.v3i3.141>.

47 G. Drover and D. Woodsworth, "Social Welfare Theory and Social Policy," *Canadian Journal of Social Work Education / Revue Canadienne d'éducation En Service Social* 4, no. 2/3 (1978): 19–41; Intan Delima et al., "Perlindungan Antara Hukum Islam Dan Undang-Undang No. 13 Tahun 2003 Tentang Ketenagakerjaan (Studi Kasus PT Gunbaster Nickel Industry)," *Jurnal Cendikia ISNU SU* 1, no. 2 (September 30, 2024): 64–69; M. Nabil Alifah et al., "Hukum Ketenagakerjaan Di Era Modern: Antara Hak Dan Kewajiban," *Jurnal Cendikia ISNU SU* 1, no. 2 (September 30, 2024): 153–57.

to progress professionally, their job satisfaction and morale significantly decrease, leading to burnout and reduced motivation. The welfare policy theory emphasizes that the government and educational institutions should play an active role in improving the social welfare of the workforce, including lecturers, by providing efficient mechanisms to facilitate the certification process.⁴⁸

2.3 Implementation of BPJS Employment Insurance for Private University Lecturers

The implementation of BPJS Ketenagakerjaan, a mandatory social security program, is inconsistent across private universities in Indonesia. Lecturers from institutions like UM in Tasikmalaya and IKH in Sukabumi reported not being covered by the program, while universities in cities like Bandung and Ciamis provide BPJS coverage. This disparity reflects unequal access to social security benefits. While some lecturers, such as those from INU C and UI B, enjoy full BPJS benefits, others, like those at IAI HP and STAI MT, face financial constraints that prevent enrollment.

The main obstacle to full implementation is the financial limitations of many private universities, particularly those funded by foundations, as reported by UIBB and IMHA. These financial challenges hinder the ability to provide the required social protection, leaving lecturers without crucial health, accident, and retirement coverage. As a result, lecturers from IAI KHS and UNA expressed feelings of insecurity, as they are not adequately protected by BPJS Ketenagakerjaan. This gap in coverage creates inequality, with lecturers in wealthier regions benefiting from better social security provisions than those in economically underdeveloped areas.⁴⁹

Welfare policies for private university lecturers, in the context of labor law,⁵⁰ should ensure that every lecturer is entitled to adequate social protection.⁵¹ According to the principles of Social Welfare Theory,⁵² social protection is a fundamental right for every worker, including lecturers. The inability of some private universities to fulfill this obligation reflects weaknesses in the welfare policies for lecturers, which should guarantee a decent quality of life and long-term security.

Lecturers from STAI DAM, Garut, STAI BA, Ciparay, Bandung,⁵³ and STESy NU, Bengkulu, emphasized that inequality in social security policies can affect lecturers' motivation and enthusiasm for their work, especially when they feel that they are not receiving adequate protection. From a labor law perspective,⁵⁴ lecturers' lack of access

48 Khudzaifah Dimiyati et al., "Indonesia as a Legal Welfare State: A Prophetic-Transcendental Basis," *Heliyon* 7, no. 8 (August 1, 2021): e07865, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2021.e07865>; M. Hafizh Maulana et al., "Analisis Hukum Ketenagakerjaan Di Indonesia," *Jurnal Cendikia ISNU SU* 1, no. 2 (September 30, 2024): 139–46; Andina Resty et al., "Pertanggungjawaban Perusahaan Dalam Kecelakaan Kerja," *Jurnal Cendikia ISNU SU* 1, no. 2 (September 30, 2024): 75–77.

49 Fauzan and Lulu Anjarsari, "Alleging Salary and Allowance Disparity, Private Lecturer Revises Petition," *en.mkri.id*, 2023, https://en.mkri.id/news/details/2023-10-31/Alleging_Salary_and-Allowance_Disparity_Private_Lecturer_Revises_Petition.

50 Inger-Johanne Sand, "What Is the Function of Welfare Law Today? Consequences of the Work-Line Policy," in *Transformations of European Welfare States and Social Rights: Regulation, Professionals, and Citizens*, ed. Stine Piilgaard Porner Nielsen and Ole Hammerslev (Cham: Springer Nature Switzerland, 2024), 41–59, https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-46637-3_3.

51 Surya Nita, "The Legal Position of Lecturer at University Which Incorporated as Foundation in Indonesia," *Yustisia* 5, no. 3 (December 28, 2016): 702–14, <https://doi.org/10.20961/yustisia.v5i3.8810>.

52 Drover and Woodsworth, "Social Welfare Theory and Social Policy."

53 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. U.H., S.H.I., M.H., as a Lecturer at STAI BA, Ciparay, Bandung, West Java, on July 15, 2024.

54 Siti Kunarti et al., "Perspective of Employment Relations and Wages in Labor Law and Islamic Law," *Samarah: Jurnal Hukum Keluarga Dan Hukum Islam* 8, no. 1 (March 31, 2024): 386–402, <https://doi.org/10.22373/sjhk.v8i1.17045>; Arifuddin Muda Harahap et al., "Challenges and Problems in Labour Law from the Perspectives of

to BPJS Ketenagakerjaan constitutes a violation of their rights as workers. Furthermore, this disparity in benefits violates the principle of fairness outlined in Law No. 13 of 2003, which mandates equitable protection for all workers, including lecturers. Distributive justice theory emphasizes the importance of fair distribution of resources to ensure that everyone receives their due rights without discrimination.⁵⁵ This principle should be reflected in welfare policies for private university lecturers.

In conclusion, the unequal implementation of BPJS Ketenagakerjaan across private universities underscores the need for stronger policies and support for institutions to ensure that all lecturers, regardless of location or the financial status of their universities, receive the social security benefits they deserve. Addressing the financial challenges faced by private universities, especially those in less developed areas, is crucial for providing equitable protection for all lecturers. The government and educational institutions must prioritize the implementation and enforcement of policies that guarantee full access to social security for lecturers, which is vital to improving their welfare, job security, and professional satisfaction.

2.4 The Role of Regulations in Achieving Justice for Private University Lecturers

To integrate labor law theories and welfare policies for private university lecturers in the context of the interviews, we need to analyze both the legal frameworks in Indonesia and their practical implementation at private universities.

Labor law theories, particularly those surrounding workplace justice,⁵⁶ and social welfare rights,⁵⁷ provide a foundation for understanding the rights of lecturers. According to John Rawls' theory of justice,⁵⁸ fair treatment in the workplace is a matter of ensuring that all workers, regardless of their position or economic context, have access to the benefits they are entitled to.⁵⁹ This theory of justice implies that lecturers, as workers in private universities, should receive fair wages, social security benefits, and professional development opportunities that are in line with the legal frameworks established by Law No. 14/2005 on Teachers and Lecturers. However, based on the interviews with lecturers from various private institutions in Indonesia, the reality does not fully reflect these legal guarantees. Lecturers in economically disadvantaged areas like Tasikmalaya, Sukabumi, and Ciamis report salaries below the regional minimum wage (UMR), a violation of the legal mandate for universities to provide fair compensation.

From the perspective of Marxist labor theory,⁶⁰ which emphasizes the relationship between labor and capital, the financial constraints of private universities can be seen as

Indonesia and Malaysia," *Malaysian Journal of Syariah and Law* 12, no. 3 (December 1, 2024): 535–49, <https://doi.org/10.33102/mjssl.vol12no3.1037>.

55 Hisam Ahyani et al., "Effectiveness of Law Enforcement Against Online Gambling Practices in Indonesia in Supporting the Achievement of SDGs," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 1 (2024): e03686–e03686, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n01.pe03686>; Eris Dhamo and Jonela Canaj, "Social Worker's Importance of Intercultural Communication for Social Service," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 2 (2024): e01757–e01757, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n02.pe01757>.

56 Ansar, I. Dewa Made Alit Karyawan, and Atri Dewi Azis, "Analysis of Workload of Corn Seed Planting Equipment Operators Integrated with Fertilization Equipment," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 4, no. 3 (September 20, 2024): e02053–e02053, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v4.n03.pe02053>.

57 Kairat A. Bakishev et al., "Sustainable Development and Worker Well-Being: Assessing and Enhancing Occupational Safety and Health and Legal Implication in Kazakhstan," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 2 (2025): e03435–e03435, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n02.pe03435>.

58 John Rawls, *A Theory of Justice* (Harvard University Press, 2009).

59 Alizon Cisneros et al., "Sustainable Development Objective 12: Eco-Efficiency Ratio of the District Municipality of Campoverde, Province of Coronel Portillo - Peru," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 4, no. 3 (September 25, 2024): e02392–e02392, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v4.n03.pe02392>.

60 Smagulov Zhaslan et al., "Public Prosecutor's Supervision Over the Observation of Citizens' Labor Rights," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 2 (2025): e2852–e2852, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n02.pe02852>.

a systemic issue that prevents lecturers from receiving adequate compensation for their work.⁶¹ Marxists argue that workers in capitalist economies, such as private universities, often experience exploitation through low wages and lack of welfare protections, despite their significant contribution to the institution's success. Many lecturers in the interviews, particularly those from IAI F in Kediri,⁶² and INU C in Ciamis, report being paid below the minimum wage and facing pressure to find additional income, such as teaching at multiple institutions or engaging in side jobs. This reinforces Marxist concerns about labor exploitation, where lecturers, as part of the workforce, do not receive sufficient compensation relative to their contribution to the university.

Moreover, neo-liberal labor policies that favor market-driven solutions may be contributing to the underfunding of private universities, especially those in economically disadvantaged regions.⁶³ Neo-liberalism emphasizes reducing government intervention in the labor market and relies on market forces to dictate wages and working conditions.⁶⁴ Interviews with lecturers in regions like Sukabumi and Tasikmalaya show that universities struggle to allocate sufficient funds for salaries and benefits, which can be attributed to their reliance on external funding and donations, rather than robust state support or institutional autonomy. This financial dependence reduces the universities' ability to provide competitive wages and necessary benefits like BPJS Ketenagakerjaan, a social security system that many lecturers, particularly those in smaller institutions, do not have access to.

In terms of social welfare policies,⁶⁵ the Indonesian government has a legal obligation to ensure the welfare of its citizens, including lecturers in private universities. The Social Security Law No. 40/2004 mandates the inclusion of all workers in the social security system, including health and employment insurance through BPJS Ketenagakerjaan. However, as seen in the interviews, there are significant gaps in implementation. Lecturers from institutions such as STAI MT, and IAI KHS, report that many of them do not have access to BPJS, or the social security benefits are inadequate. This highlights a failure in welfare policy enforcement. According to theories of social justice,⁶⁶ it is the responsibility of the state to ensure that welfare programs are universally accessible and provide workers with protection from risks such as health issues, workplace injuries, and old age. The disparity in welfare provisions between institutions in economically wealthy areas like Bandung and those in poorer regions like Sukabumi or Tasikmalaya shows a lack of equality and fairness in policy enforcement, which contradicts the

61 Horace William Brindley Joseph, *The Labour Theory of Value in Karl Marx* (Oxford University Press, H. Milford, 1923).

62 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. M.H., M.H., as a Lecturer at IAI F, Kediri, East Java, on July 12, 2024.

63 Shona Loong, "The Neoliberal Borderscape: Neoliberalism's Effects on the Social Worlds of Migrants along the Thai-Myanmar Border," *Political Geography* 74 (October 1, 2019): 102035, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.polgeo.2019.102035>.

64 Kenneth L. Armas and Rhodora R. Jugo, "Education for a Sustainable Future: Analysis of Universities' vision and Mission Statements in Line With Global Sustainable Development Goals," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 4, no. 1 (August 2, 2024): e01790–e01790, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v4.n00.pe01790>; Suwarsono et al., "The Future of the Civilization of the Ummah Is Reviewed from the Sociology of Education for the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG'S)," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 4, no. 1 (July 29, 2024): e01688–e01688, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v4.n00.pe01688>.

65 Hadiqa Ahmad, Muhammad Yaqub, and Seung Hwan Lee, "Environmental-, Social-, and Governance-Related Factors for Business Investment and Sustainability: A Scientometric Review of Global Trends," *Environment, Development and Sustainability* 26, no. 2 (February 1, 2024): 2965–87, <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10668-023-02921-x>.

66 Naisabur et al., "The Prohibition of Social E-Commerce on TikTok Shop"; Fitria Aprilia, Neisya, and Mutmainnah, "Beyond Chains: Re-Examining Identity and Resilience in '12 Years A Slave' for SDGs in Education and Social Justice," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 1 (2024): e03354–e03354, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n01.pe03354>.

principles of distributive justice, where benefits and protections should be distributed equitably.⁶⁷

From a public policy perspective,⁶⁸ the Indonesian government and private universities need to collaborate more effectively to implement policies that close these gaps.⁶⁹ The Theory of Public Administration argues that public policy must be enforced efficiently and equitably across all sectors.⁷⁰ In the case of private universities, this means ensuring that the rights outlined in Law No. 14/2005 are not only formalized but also operationalized within each institution, regardless of its financial capacity. Lecturers from UNUP, and IAI HP, have called for reforms to speed up the certification process, improve salary standards, and provide more consistent access to BPJS Ketenagakerjaan, so they can feel secure in their work.

In conclusion, integrating these labor law theories and welfare policies shows that while Indonesia's legal framework guarantees specific rights for private university lecturers, the gap between law and practice is substantial. The challenges highlighted in the interviews reflect broader issues in labor justice, financial constraints, and social welfare policies that need to be addressed to ensure that all lecturers, regardless of their university's financial standing, can access the rights and benefits they are entitled to by law.⁷¹ Through better enforcement, equitable distribution of resources, and a more committed approach from both the government and private universities, the welfare of lecturers can be improved, thereby ensuring fair treatment and justice in the academic workforce.

2.5 Disparities in Welfare of Private University Lecturers Based on Employment Contracts

Interviews with lecturers from various private universities revealed significant issues with employment contracts, particularly regarding inadequate compensation and lack of career progression. Lecturers from Bengkulu, Tasikmalaya, Ciamis, and Sukabumi shared frustrations about not being paid on time or being underpaid, with some institutions citing financial struggles. Many lecturers also reported being required to

67 İper İncekara, Almula Umay Karamanhoğlu, and Ünsal Sığrı, "Ethical Leadership Behaviors and Employee Perceptions of Organizational Justice: A Qualitative Research," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 2 (2024): e03122–e03122, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n02.pe03122>; Nurul Ilyana Muhd Adnan et al., "Leveraging Qardhul Hasan Practices from Zakat Funds for Sustainable Development: A Maqasid Sharia Perspective and Its Contribution to SDGs in Malaysia," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 2 (2024): e03989–e03989, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n02.pe03989>.

68 Faradillah Paratama et al., "Reconstructing Civil Service Recruitment Policies in Indonesia: Ensuring Justice and Equity in Regional ASN Procurement Aligned with SDG 8 And SDG 10," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 1 (2024): e03100–e03100, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n01.pe03100>.

69 Ricardo Enrique Grundy-López et al., "Local Public Policies in the Field of Sports: A Systematic Review of the Literature from the SDG," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 4, no. 2 (August 14, 2024): e01828–e01828, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v4.n02.pe01828>; Felix Magno Pomachari Carranza, "Barriers and Limitations in Protocols to Protect the Right to Property in Sporting Events from the Perspective of the SDGs," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 2 (2024): e03126–e03126, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n02.pe03126>.

70 Norhasni Zainal Abiddin and Gbenga Akinyemi, "The Intersection Between E-Tax Administration, Sustainable Public Procurement and Sustainable Public Performance: A Review Conceptual Framework," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 4, no. 2 (August 29, 2024): e02328–e02328, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v4.n02.pe02328>; Muhamad Subhi Apriantoro and Widiva Febri Ananda, "Empowering Equality Law With Nlp: A Social Network Analysis Approach to Drive Legal SDGs," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 4, no. 1 (July 29, 2024): e01769–e01769, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v4.n00.pe01769>.

71 Hisam Ahyani et al., "Enhancing the Legal Protection of Waqf Assets in Banjar City, West Java, Through Land Registration and Regulatory Awareness to Support the Achievement of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 2 (2024): e03989–e03989, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n02.pe03989>.

work extra hours or take on administrative duties without additional compensation, leading to burnout and financial strain. For example, a lecturer in Tasikmalaya had to take on additional teaching roles to meet basic needs. Furthermore, lecturers expressed dissatisfaction with the lack of career advancement opportunities. Despite holding advanced degrees and years of experience, lecturers in Sukabumi and Ciamis found no promotion or salary increases based on their qualifications or service. This lack of recognition led to a decline in job satisfaction, with many feeling undervalued and demotivated.

From the perspective of Labor Rights Theory, the interviews reveal that many lecturers are working under conditions that violate their fundamental rights to fair compensation and career growth. The theory of exploitation,⁷² as discussed by Karl Marx, is also evident, with lecturers providing significant labor to the institutions without receiving compensation that matches their work. Many of the lecturers interviewed from regions like Ciamis, Tasikmalaya, and Bengkulu expressed feelings of being economically exploited by their institutions, which rely on their labor while failing to provide the promised financial rewards. This exploitation reflects a failure to meet the fair wage principle, a core aspect of labor law.⁷³

Social welfare policies, particularly BPJS Ketenagakerjaan, emerged as a key concern during interviews with lecturers. Many reported not being registered for BPJS, especially those from smaller, economically underdeveloped areas like Tasikmalaya and Sukabumi, leaving them vulnerable to financial insecurity in cases of illness, accidents, or old age. In contrast, universities in larger cities like Bandung were able to enroll their staff, highlighting a disparity in social security coverage. This inequality reflects a failure to meet the Theory of Social Justice, which advocates for equitable resource distribution to ensure a dignified life for all.

The interviews also revealed the need for reforms in employment contracts. Lecturers, particularly from Tasikmalaya and Ciamis, called for clearer terms regarding compensation, job security, and career development. A lecturer from Bandung stressed the importance of transparent contracts that not only reflect academic qualifications and teaching hours but also the broader contributions of lecturers. The lack of such provisions in current contracts often forces lecturers to take on additional roles to maintain financial stability, exacerbating work-life imbalance, as seen in Sukabumi and Tasikmalaya.⁷⁴

Financial constraints in private universities are a major obstacle to the effective implementation of labor laws and welfare policies. A lecturer from Bengkulu explained that their institution could not provide adequate compensation or benefits due to reliance on donations and limited resources. This issue was widespread, particularly in economically disadvantaged regions like Ciamis and Sukabumi. Without sufficient

72 Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi et al., "Developing an Islamic Human Resource Development Mode (IHRD) to Strengthen the Organization's Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 1 (2024): e03289–e03289, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n01.pe03289>.

73 Ahyani, Slamet, and Tobroni, "Building the Values of Rahmatan Lil 'Alamin for Indonesian Economic Development at 4.0 Era from the Perspective of Philosophy and Islamic Economic Law"; Eko Budiono et al., "Analyzing the Legal Framework of Substitute Heirs in Islamic Inheritance Cases: DKI Jakarta High Religious Courts Perspective," *Syariah: Jurnal Hukum Dan Pemikiran* 23, no. 2 (2023): 281–99, <https://doi.org/10.18592/sjhp.v23i2.12545>; Anisa Fellani et al., "Community Empowerment Efforts Through Creative Economic Training for Housewives with Batik Jumputan in Purwajaya Village, Ciamis Regency," *Jurnal Nahdlatul Fikr* 7, no. 1 (October 10, 2024): 60–69.

74 Moses Kwadzo Ahiabu et al., "Beyond Bricks and Mortar: Work-Life Balance and Project Performance of Ghana's Construction Professionals – Does Co-Worker Relationship Quality Matter?," *Social Sciences & Humanities Open* 10 (January 1, 2024): 100940, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssaho.2024.100940>.

funding, private universities are unable to meet their legal obligations, such as providing fair compensation, career advancement opportunities, and social security coverage.

In conclusion, the challenges faced by private university lecturers in Indonesia, including inadequate employment contracts and welfare provisions, highlight the urgent need for institutional reform. The 24 interviews revealed that universities must prioritize fair contracts that ensure proper compensation, career growth, and social security benefits. Without these, many lecturers struggle to meet basic needs, negatively impacting their well-being and the quality of education. To address these issues, stronger enforcement of regulations and support for financially constrained institutions are essential to ensure the fair treatment and welfare of private university lecturers throughout Indonesia.⁷⁵

2.6 The Role of Universities and Institutions in Improving Lecturer Welfare

Interviews with lecturers from various private universities in Indonesia reveal significant disparities in support for lecturer welfare across regions. For example, while universities in Bandung provide housing for lecturers, those in Ciamis and Purwokerto do not offer similar support, forcing lecturers to manage housing and living expenses independently. Many lecturers in smaller cities like Tasikmalaya and Sukabumi also report heavy workloads without adequate compensation or recognition for extra teaching hours, highlighting a gap in the implementation of the 2005 Law on Teachers and Lecturers (Law No. 14/2005).

A key issue contributing to the challenges faced by lecturers is the financial limitations of many private universities, particularly those dependent on foundations or donations. This financial strain prevents institutions from providing proper compensation, career development opportunities, or essential benefits like BPJS Ketenagakerjaan. Lecturers in areas such as Ciamis and Purwokerto have reported being denied social security coverage, leaving them vulnerable to health issues or retirement without support, which contradicts labor law and social welfare principles.

In addition to financial constraints, many lecturers feel their career progression is hindered by restrictive employment contracts. Lecturers from Tasikmalaya and Sukabumi expressed frustration with the lack of advancement opportunities, feeling their academic achievements were overlooked. This sense of stagnation aligns with employment welfare theory, which emphasizes the importance of supporting employee growth. However, some universities, like those in Bandung, have made efforts to improve welfare by providing housing, reducing financial stress for lecturers in costly areas.⁷⁶

This commitment to lecturer welfare aligns with human resource management (HRM) theories,⁷⁷ which emphasize the importance of investing in employee well-being

⁷⁵ Loresta Cahyaning Lintang, Adriano Martufi, and J. W. Ouwerker, "The Alternative Concepts of Blasphemy Law in Indonesia: Legal Comparison with Ireland and Canada," *BESTUUR* 9, no. 1 (August 12, 2021): 13–25, <https://doi.org/10.20961/bestuur.v9i1.51632>; Awaludin Marwan, Diana Odier-Contreras Garduño, and Fiammetta Bonfigli, "Detection of Digital Law Issues and Implication for Good Governance Policy in Indonesia," *BESTUUR* 10, no. 1 (August 6, 2022): 22–32, <https://doi.org/10.20961/bestuur.v10i1.59143>; Ais Surasa, "Dynamics of Critical Thinking Among Islamic Family Law Students: A Study at Stisa Ash-Shofa Manonjaya," *Jurnal Nahdlatul Fikr* 6, no. 2 (September 9, 2024): 69–80; Septi Kustiana et al., "Legal Protection of Land Assets of Waqf Muhammadiyah and Nahdlatul Ulama in Magelang District," *Ijtihad* 18, no. 1 (June 15, 2024), <https://doi.org/10.21111/ijtihad.v18i1.12484>; Ahyani, "Integrating Shariah Principles in Modern Family and Economic Life for Social Well-Being and Justice."

⁷⁶ Interview and Data Collected from Mr. A.S., S.Ag., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at UIB, Bandung City, West Java, on July 22, 2024.

⁷⁷ Sri Annisa and Elisabet Siahaan, "Human Resource Management in the Era of Disruption: A Systematic Literature Review On SDG," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 4, no. 2 (August 19, 2024): e01620–e01620, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v4.n02.pe01620>; Lok Huey Kei et al., "Mitigating Human-Elephant Conflict: A Comprehensive Review of Strategies for Sustainable Coexistence in Support of SDG 15," *Journal of Life-*

for organizational success. A lecturer from Bandung shared that housing allowances and other benefits offered by the university had improved job satisfaction, helping lecturers focus on teaching and academic responsibilities. Additionally, providing social security through BPJS Ketenagakerjaan is seen as a critical step in protecting the health, safety, and future of lecturers, as stated by a lecturer from Sukabumi, “Without BPJS, we are exposed to financial ruin in case of illness or accident.”⁷⁸

Sustainable Welfare Policies and Their Impact on Education Quality: As per Maslow’s hierarchy of needs, lecturers’ basic financial and social security needs must be met for them to focus on higher-level academic and professional goals.⁷⁹ Interviews revealed that lecturers who were supported in meeting their basic needs were more motivated and productive. One lecturer from Purwokerto stated, “When I’m not worried about paying bills or finding extra work, I can give more time to preparing better lessons and supporting students.”⁸⁰ This underscores the importance of sustainable welfare policies that not only address immediate financial needs but also support long-term academic and personal development.

Addressing Disparities in Welfare: Despite some efforts, substantial disparities remain across regions, particularly between institutions in economically developed areas like Bandung and Ciamis, and those in smaller cities like Ciamis, Purwokerto, and Tasikmalaya. These disparities contribute to frustration among lecturers, as they feel that unequal support leads to unequal opportunities for career advancement. As one lecturer from Tasikmalaya put it, “There is a clear gap in how universities in big cities treat their lecturers compared to those in small towns. This inequality needs to be addressed.”⁸¹ This situation reflects the concerns of social justice theory, which advocates for fairness and equality in the distribution of resources and opportunities.⁸²

Conclusion: In conclusion, while some universities have made significant strides in improving lecturer welfare, many others are still struggling to meet the basic needs of their academic staff. The disparity in welfare across different regions and institutions highlights the urgent need for institutional reform and stronger government intervention to ensure that all lecturers, regardless of their university’s financial situation, receive the benefits and support they deserve. This requires a concerted effort to align the legal frameworks, such as the 2005 Law on Teachers and Lecturers, with practical implementation, ensuring that BPJS Ketenagakerjaan, housing benefits, fair compensation, and career development opportunities are available for all lecturers. Labor law theories and welfare policies emphasize that a well-supported lecturer is likely to be more motivated and productive, ultimately contributing to a better quality of education and a more sustainable academic environment.

style and SDGs Review 5, no. 2 (2024): e02756–e02756, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n02.pe02756>.

⁷⁸ Interview and Data Collected from Mr. Z.Z., M.Ag., as a Lecturer at IKH, Sukabumi City, West Java, on July 15, 2024.

⁷⁹ Mariano Rojas, Alfonso Méndez, and Karen Watkins-Fassler, “The Hierarchy of Needs Empirical Examination of Maslow’s Theory and Lessons for Development,” *World Development* 165 (May 1, 2023): 106185, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2023.106185>.

⁸⁰ Interview and Data Collected from Mr. A.S., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at UNUP, Banyumas Regency, Central Java, on July 30, 2024.

⁸¹ Interview and Data Collected from Mr. D.S., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at STAI MT, West Java, on July 25, 2024.

⁸² Thaer Hasan Kadhim ALhargose and Mounir Ben Aissa, “The Impact of Knowledge Management Processes on Intellectual Capital: An Exploratory Study of Employees at Al-Rasheed Bank 515 In Diwaniya, Iraq,” *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 4, no. 4 (November 22, 2024): e03554–e03554, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v4.n04.pe03554>.

2.7 The Condition of Lecturers Without Academic Positions

The Impact of Not Having an Academic Position on Lecturer Careers and Salaries: A significant number of permanent lecturers in Indonesia, totaling 59,411, still do not hold an academic position, which deeply impacts their careers and financial well-being.⁸³ According to interviews conducted with lecturers from various private universities, including those in Bandung, Tasikmalaya, and Purwokerto, the lack of an academic position severely hinders their career advancement and income. One lecturer from Purwokerto shared, “I’ve been teaching for over a decade, but without an academic rank, my pay doesn’t reflect my qualifications, and I cannot apply for higher-paying roles.”⁸⁴ This view was echoed by several other lecturers, such as one from Ciamis, who explained, “Without an academic position, it’s almost impossible to access higher leadership roles or more advanced academic opportunities.”⁸⁵

As labor law theories suggest, all workers are entitled to fair compensation and opportunities for career growth according to their qualifications and contributions. The absence of an academic position creates an imbalance, denying lecturers the right to equal treatment in terms of career progression, as outlined in Indonesian labor law and International Labour Organization (ILO) conventions on workers’ rights. Lecturers also reported a sense of frustration and feeling undervalued when their years of service, qualifications, and dedication go unrecognized. One lecturer from Sukabumi stated, “Without recognition of my academic achievements, I feel like my efforts are disregarded, and it’s demotivating.”⁸⁶

Furthermore, lecturers expressed concern over the stagnation of their careers due to the lack of academic ranks. As noted by a lecturer from Banjar, “Not having an academic position means I’m not eligible for promotions, leadership positions, or even significant salary increases.”⁸⁷ Without the opportunity to gain academic ranks, lecturers struggle financially, often relying on side jobs or additional certifications to make ends meet. This reflects the core principle of career welfare theory, which asserts that workers’ well-being and motivation are directly influenced by the recognition and progression of their careers.

Solutions for Improving the Provision of Academic Positions for Lecturers: To address these issues, lecturers from various regions, including Purwokerto and Tasikmalaya, emphasized the need for better policies from private universities to ensure that permanent lecturers are granted academic positions in line with their qualifications and contributions. One lecturer from Medan stated, “We need an academic position that reflects our qualifications and experience. It is essential for career growth and financial stability.”⁸⁸ These sentiments were shared by lecturers across different regions, including Ciamis and Bandung, who argued that academic ranks would not only provide them with recognition but also better opportunities for promotions and higher salaries.

83 Dina Yanuary, “University Leaders Forum, 172 PTS Jabar-Banten Konsolidasi Tingkatkan Mutu Pendidikan,” *LLDIKTI Wilayah 4* (blog), October 21, 2024, <https://lldikti4.kemdikbud.go.id/2024/10/university-leaders-forum-172-pts-jabar-banten-konsolidasi-tingkatkan-mutu-pendidikan/>.

84 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. A.S., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at UNUP, Banyumas Regency, Central Java, on July 30, 2024.

85 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. U.I.M., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at INU C, West Java, on July 5, 2024.

86 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. Z.Z., M.Ag., as a Lecturer at IKH, Sukabumi City, West Java, on July 15, 2024.

87 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. M.S.H., S.Pd., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at IMHA, West Java, on July 20, 2024.

88 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. I.U.T., S.H., M.H., as a Lecturer at UPPB, Medan City, North Sumatra, on July 10, 2024.

From a labor law perspective, ensuring that lecturers hold academic positions aligns with the right to equal opportunity and fair compensation, as guaranteed under the 2005 Law on Teachers and Lecturers (Law No. 14/2005). This law asserts that lecturers' rights to career progression and benefits should be based on their qualifications, years of service, and contributions. By providing lecturers with academic ranks, universities can enhance recognition, increase job satisfaction, and motivate lecturers to excel in their academic roles. Human resource development (HRD) theories suggest that a workforce with clear paths for advancement and recognition performs better, which would also contribute to a more productive academic environment.⁸⁹

One lecturer from Ciamis reflected, "If my academic position were recognized, I would be able to focus more on teaching and research instead of worrying about side jobs to make ends meet."⁹⁰ This demonstrates the strong link between career recognition and overall job satisfaction. Additionally, granting academic positions would allow lecturers to participate in higher-level academic leadership, conduct advanced research, and contribute more to their institutions, improving both their professional development and their financial stability.

Conclusion: The welfare of private university lecturers in Indonesia remains far from ideal, particularly in relation to the lack of academic positions. Despite the 2005 Law on Teachers and Lecturers (Law No. 14/2005), which theoretically ensures lecturers' rights, the implementation of these regulations is often hindered by financial limitations within private universities. Lecturers across Tasikmalaya, Sukabumi, and Purwokerto shared similar concerns about the lack of support and opportunities due to the absence of academic ranks. One lecturer from Ciamis noted, "The lack of academic positions limits our ability to develop professionally and financially."⁹¹

Welfare policies aimed at safeguarding lecturers' rights, such as those related to career progression and fair compensation, are crucial for creating an equitable academic environment. The current gap in academic positions contributes significantly to lecturers' financial and career instability. The interview results from Bandung, Medan, and Bengkulu strongly suggest that addressing the lack of academic positions, along with other issues such as salary disparities and limited social security benefits, is vital for improving lecturers' welfare.

In line with labor law theories and welfare policy frameworks, it is essential for private universities to adopt more effective policies that ensure lecturers are granted academic positions, fair compensation, and career development opportunities. This would not only enhance their professional satisfaction and financial stability but also contribute to the overall quality of education. Private universities must take a more proactive role in addressing these disparities, ensuring that lecturers are recognized for their contributions and provided with the necessary support to thrive both professionally and personally.

89 Umu Rosyidah et al., "Unleashing Innovation Potential: The Role of Human Capital and Digital Capability to Increase Firm Performance for Sustainable Development Goals (SDGS) in Lombok Island," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 1 (2024): e02670–e02670, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n01.pe02670>; Liudan Wang et al., "Examining Digital Talent Acquisition and Recruitment Strategies to Enhance Economic Sustainable Development Goals (SDGS) Of SME'S in China's Internet Industry," *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 4, no. 3 (September 20, 2024): e02306–e02306, <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v4.n03.pe02306>.

90 Interview and Data Collected from Mr. U.I.M., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at INU C, West Java, on July 5, 2024.

91 Interview and Data Collected from Mrs. P.F., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at STIT L, Ciamis, West Java, on July 10, 2024.

3. CONCLUSION

This study highlights several key issues affecting the welfare of private lecturers in Indonesia, including salary disparities, delays in certification, and lack of BPJS Ketenagakerjaan coverage. Many lecturers earn below the regional minimum wage due to financial constraints in private universities, leading them to seek additional work. The certification process is often delayed, hindering career advancement and additional income. Moreover, despite being a legal entitlement, many universities fail to provide BPJS Ketenagakerjaan due to financial limitations, leaving lecturers without essential benefits.

The study also found that while laws like Law No. 14 of 2005 are designed to protect lecturers' welfare, their implementation is often insufficient, primarily due to resource constraints. In conclusion, stronger enforcement of these laws and improvements in their practical application are necessary to address the inequalities and ensure fairer welfare for private lecturers in Indonesia.

REFERENCES

- Abiddin, Norhasni Zainal, and Gbenga Akinyemi. "The Intersection Between E-Tax Administration, Sustainable Public Procurement and Sustainable Public Performance: A Review Conceptual Framework." *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 4, no. 2 (August 29, 2024): e02328–e02328. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v4.n02.pe02328>.
- Adnan, Nurul Ilyana Muhd, Nik Abdul Rahim nik Abdul Ghani, Hisam Ahyani, Syamsudin, Irfan Soleh, Memet Slamet, Naeli Mutmainah, Sérgio António Neves Lousada, and Trianah Sofiani. "Leveraging Qardhul Hasan Practices from Zakat Funds for Sustainable Development: A Maqasid Sharia Perspective and Its Contribution to SDGs in Malaysia." *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 2 (2024): e03989–e03989. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n02.pe03989>.
- Agustanti, Rosalia Dika, Yuliana Yuli Wahyuningsih, and Satino Satino. "Guarantee Of Worker Rights During The Covid 19 Pandemic." *Jambura Law Review* 3, no. 0 (May 1, 2021): 77–95. <https://doi.org/10.33756/jlr.v3i0.7914>.
- Ahiabu, Moses Kwadzo, Eric Kodzo Adzivor, Jeannette A. Attipoe, Joan-Ark Manu Agyapong, and Martin Kwasi Abiemo. "Beyond Bricks and Mortar: Work-Life Balance and Project Performance of Ghana's Construction Professionals – Does Co-Worker Relationship Quality Matter?" *Social Sciences & Humanities Open* 10 (January 1, 2024): 100940. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssaho.2024.100940>.
- Ahmad, Hadiqa, Muhammad Yaqub, and Seung Hwan Lee. "Environmental-, Social-, and Governance-Related Factors for Business Investment and Sustainability: A Scientometric Review of Global Trends." *Environment, Development and Sustainability* 26, no. 2 (February 1, 2024): 2965–87. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10668-023-02921-x>.
- Ahyani, Hisam. "Integrating Shariah Principles in Modern Family and Economic Life for Social Well-Being and Justice." *Jurnal Munakahat* 1, no. 1 (December 24, 2024): 79–89.

- . “Protecting Yourself from Online Fraud and Hacking: An Islamic Perspective.” *Abdurrauf Journal of Islamic Studies* 3, no. 3 (October 4, 2024): 171–80. <https://doi.org/10.58824/arjis.v3i3.141>.
- Ahyani, Hisam, Arifuddin Muda Harahap, Ending Solehudin, Nurul Ilyana Muhd Adnan, Naeli Mutmainah, Supaprawat Siripipatthanakul, Sérgio António Neves Lousada, Haris Maiza Putra, and Dwi Novita. “Effectiveness of Law Enforcement Against Online Gambling Practices in Indonesia in Supporting the Achievement of SDGs.” *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 1 (2024): e03686–e03686. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n01.pe03686>.
- Ahyani, Hisam, Naeli Mutmainah, Md Yazid Ahmad, Sérgio António Neves Lousada, Yogi Triswandani, Encep Taufik Rahman, Opik Rozikin, et al. “Enhancing the Legal Protection of Waqf Assets in Banjar City, West Java, Through Land Registration and Regulatory Awareness to Support the Achievement of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).” *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 2 (2024): e03989–e03989. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n02.pe03989>.
- Ahyani, Hisam, Memet Slamet, and Tobroni. “Building the Values of Rahmatan Lil ‘Alamin for Indonesian Economic Development at 4.0 Era from the Perspective of Philosophy and Islamic Economic Law.” *Al-Ihkam: Jurnal Hukum & Pranata Sosial* 16, no. 1 (June 27, 2021): 111–36. <https://doi.org/10.19105/al-ihkam.v16i1.4550>.
- ALhargose, Thaer Hasan Kadhim, and Mounir Ben Aissa. “The Impact of Knowledge Management Processes on Intellectual Capital: An Exploratory Study of Employees at Al-Rasheed Bank 515 In Diwaniya, Iraq.” *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 4, no. 4 (November 22, 2024): e03554–e03554. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v4.n04.pe03554>.
- Alifah, M. Nabil, Andre Kurniawan, Alfa Cygni, and Muhammad Sobri. “Hukum Ketenagakerjaan Di Era Modern: Antara Hak Dan Kewajiban.” *Jurnal Cendikia ISNU SU* 1, no. 2 (September 30, 2024): 153–57.
- Annisa, Sri, and Elisabet Siahaan. “Human Resource Management in the Era of Disruption: A Systematic Literature Review On SDG.” *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 4, no. 2 (August 19, 2024): e01620–e01620. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v4.n02.pe01620>.
- Ansar, I. Dewa Made Alit Karyawan, and Atri Dewi Azis. “Analysis of Workload of Corn Seed Planting Equipment Operators Integrated with Fertilization Equipment.” *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 4, no. 3 (September 20, 2024): e02053–e02053. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v4.n03.pe02053>.
- Aprianoro, Muhamad Subhi, and Widiva Febri Ananda. “Empowering Equality Law With Nlp: A Social Network Analysis Approach to Drive Legal SDGs.” *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 4, no. 1 (July 29, 2024): e01769–e01769. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v4.n00.pe01769>.
- Aprilia, Fitria, Neisya, and Mutmainnah. “Beyond Chains: Re-Examining Identity and Resilience in ‘12 Years A Slave’ for SDGs in Education and Social Justice.”

Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review 5, no. 1 (2024): e03354–e03354. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n01.pe03354>.

- Aprilia, Nadhiva Putri, and Kadek Cahya Susila Wibawa. "Prospectus of Salary/Wage Subsidy Policy for Worker Welfare Improvement During Covid-19 Pandemic." *Jurnal IUS Kajian Hukum Dan Keadilan* 9, no. 3 (December 10, 2021). <https://doi.org/10.29303/ius.v9i3.899>.
- Arifin, Ridwan, Rodiyah Rodiyah, and Fitria Puspita. "A Comparative Analysis of Indonesia's KPK and Hong Kong ICAC in Eradicating Corruption." *Jambe Law Journal* 2, no. 2 (2019): 163–79. <https://doi.org/10.22437/jlj.2.2.163-179>.
- Armas, Kenneth L., and Rhodora R. Jugo. "Education for a Sustainable Future: Analysis of Universitiesvision and Mission Statements in Line With Global Sustainable Development Goals." *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 4, no. 1 (August 2, 2024): e01790–e01790. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v4.n00.pe01790>.
- Astuti, Eka Widi, Oki Kustiwa, M. Arief Syahroni, and Wahyu Subagyo. "Legal Enforcement Of Innocent Passage Implementation In Indonesian Waters." *Jurnal IUS Kajian Hukum Dan Keadilan* 7, no. 2 (August 6, 2019): 282–92. <https://doi.org/10.29303/ius.v7i2.660>.
- Azouz, Ali, Nicolas Antheaume, and Brigitte Charles-Pauvers. "An Ethnography of Fairness Perceptions among Non-Family Employees: Does Religion Matter?" *Journal of Family Business Strategy* 12, no. 3 (September 1, 2021): 100375. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfbs.2020.100375>.
- Bakishev, Kairat A., Sergei V. Malikov, Alikjan K. Fetkulov, Assylmurat K. Alikhan, and Erjan S. Abiev. "Sustainable Development and Worker Well-Being: Assessing and Enhancing Occupational Safety and Health and Legal Implication in Kazakhstan." *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 2 (2025): e03435–e03435. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n02.pe03435>.
- Bhatti, Muhammad Safdar, Rizki Maulana, and Imron Hamzah. "Legal Politics in Transforming Islamic Norms in Sexual Violence Law: A Maqasid al-Shariah Analysis." *Jurnal Munakahat* 1, no. 1 (December 24, 2024): 33–43.
- Budiono, Eko, Oyo Sunaryo Mukhlis, Mustofa Mustofa, Ending Solehudin, and Ahmad Hasan Ridwan. "Analyzing the Legal Framework of Substitute Heirs in Islamic Inheritance Cases: DKI Jakarta High Religious Courts Perspective." *Syariah: Jurnal Hukum Dan Pemikiran* 23, no. 2 (2023): 281–99. <https://doi.org/10.18592/sjhp.v23i2.12545>.
- Carranza, Felix Magno Pomachari. "Barriers and Limitations in Protocols to Protect the Right to Property in Sporting Events from the Perspective of the SDGs." *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 2 (2024): e03126–e03126. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n02.pe03126>.
- Cisneros, Alizon, Gabriel Mercado-Jauregui, Manuel Reategui-Inga, Yovana Quinto Corilloclla, Peter Coaguila-Rodriguez, and José Kalión Guerra Lu. "Sustainable Development Objective 12: Eco-Efficiency Ratio of the District Municipality of Campoverde, Province of Coronel Portillo - Peru." *Journal of Lifestyle and*

- SDGs Review* 4, no. 3 (September 25, 2024): e02392–e02392. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v4.n03.pe02392>.
- Delima, Intan, Nurenzy Turahmi, Ray Habib Bayhaqqi, Zeinadib, Bela Amelia, and Kristin Pasaribu. “Perlindungan Antara Hukum Islam Dan Undang-Undang No. 13 Tahun 2003 Tentang Ketenagakerjaan (Studi Kasus PT Gunbaster Nickel Industry).” *Jurnal Cendikia ISNU SU* 1, no. 2 (September 30, 2024): 64–69.
- Dhamo, Eris, and Jonela Canaj. “Social Worker’s Importance of Intercultural Communication for Social Service.” *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 2 (2024): e01757–e01757. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n02.pe01757>.
- Dhiaulhaq Ar, Muhammad Irfan, and Dodik Setiawan Nur Heriyanto. “Striking A Balance Between Job Creation and Sustainability: The Need to Establish A True Environmental Protection Authority in Indonesia.” *Jambe Law Journal* 7, no. 1 (May 31, 2024): 1–23. <https://doi.org/10.22437/home.v7i1.317>.
- Dimyati, Khudzaifah, Haedar Nashir, Elviandri Elviandri, Absori Absori, Kelik Wardiono, and Arief Budiono. “Indonesia as a Legal Welfare State: A Prophetic-Transcendental Basis.” *Heliyon* 7, no. 8 (August 1, 2021): e07865. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2021.e07865>.
- Dizon, Michael Anthony C. “Socio-Legal Study of Technology: A Norms and Values Approach to Hacking and Encryption Law and Policy.” *Computer Law & Security Review* 52 (April 1, 2024): 105958. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clsr.2024.105958>.
- Drover, G., and D. Woodsworth. “Social Welfare Theory and Social Policy.” *Canadian Journal of Social Work Education / Revue Canadienne d’éducation En Service Social* 4, no. 2/3 (1978): 19–41.
- Fauzan, and Lulu Anjarsari. “Alleging Salary and Allowance Disparity, Private Lecturer Revises Petition.” [en.mkri.id](https://en.mkri.id/news/details/2023-10-31/Alleging_Salary_and_Allowance_Disparity,_Private_Lecturer_Revises_Petition), 2023. https://en.mkri.id/news/details/2023-10-31/Alleging_Salary_and_Allowance_Disparity,_Private_Lecturer_Revises_Petition.
- Fellani, Anisa, Muhammad Anwar Hilmi, Isa Mahendra, Fathul Majid, Efi Nurafifah, Nurwahidayah, Vieri Saputra Rianto, Salasatun Hidayaturrohman, La Abdul Wahid, and Retno Yuniar Nessha. “Community Empowerment Efforts Through Creative Economic Training for Housewives with Batik Jumputan in Purwajaya Village, Ciamis Regency.” *Jurnal Nahdlatul Fikr* 7, no. 1 (October 10, 2024): 60–69.
- Goodin, Robert E. *Reasons for Welfare: The Political Theory of the Welfare State*. Princeton University Press, 1988. <https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctv173f05w>.
- Grundy-López, Ricardo Enrique, Renato Paredes-Velazco, Hugo Efraín Aguilar-Gonzales, and Aleixandre Brian Duche-Pérez. “Local Public Policies in the Field of Sports: A Systematic Review of the Literature from the SDG.” *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 4, no. 2 (August 14, 2024): e01828–e01828. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v4.n02.pe01828>.
- Guevarra, Anna Luisa C., Yogi Tri Prasetyo, Ardivin Kester S. Ong, and Klint Allen

- Mariñas. “Employees’ Preference Analysis on Lean Six Sigma Program Coaching Attributes Using a Conjoint Analysis Approach.” *Heliyon* 9, no. 7 (July 1, 2023): e17846. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e17846>.
- Hamzah, Any Suryani. “Strengthening The Relationality of Heteronomous and Autonomous Legal Rules in Workers’ Decent Wage Law Policies (An Attempt to Create a Dignified Tripartid Ecosystem).” *Jurnal IUS Kajian Hukum Dan Keadilan* 11, no. 2 (August 25, 2023). <https://doi.org/10.29303/ius.v11i2.1241>.
- Hariyanto. “Risk-Based Business License and Problems Arising After The Job Creation ACT.” *Jurnal IUS Kajian Hukum Dan Keadilan* 10, no. 2 (August 23, 2022): 354–66. <https://doi.org/10.29303/ius.v10i2.1082>.
- Hartati, Dwi Surya, and Nely Herlina. “Utilization of Economic Rights in Music and Song Works as A Pillar of Creative Economy.” *Jambe Law Journal* 1, no. 1 (July 9, 2018): 115–33. <https://doi.org/10.22437/jlj.1.1.115-133>.
- Harun, Nurlaila, Hisam Ahyani, Indrius Kuklys, and Supaprawat Siripipatthanakul. “The Transformation of Elopement: From Social Stigma to Practical Solution: A Comparative Study of Elopement Practices Among Indonesian Youth.” *Kawanua International Journal of Multicultural Studies* 5, no. 2 (December 29, 2024): 255–70. <https://doi.org/10.30984/kijms.v5i2.1250>.
- Hasan, Faradila, Arwansyah Bin Kirin, António José Pereira Figueiredo, Yuliya S. Blazhevich, and Muhammad Abdul Mu’iz. “Grounding Shariah through the Flexi-Parenting Approach to Achieve Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in Family Life.” *Jurnal Munakahat* 1, no. 1 (December 24, 2024): 67–79.
- Hidayah, Nur Putri, Quincy R. Cloet, and David Pradhan. “The Implementation of Labor Development Principles According to Job Creation Law as a Reason to Protect Wages Rights.” *BESTUUR* 9, no. 1 (August 12, 2021): 68–76. <https://doi.org/10.20961/bestuur.v9i1.49252>.
- Oncekara, Öper, Almula Umay Karamanlıoğlu, and Ünsal Söğüt. “Ethical Leadership Behaviors and Employee Perceptions of Organizational Justice: A Qualitative Research.” *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 2 (2024): e03122–e03122. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n02.pe03122>.
- Interview and Data Collected from Mr. A.S., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at UNUP, Banyumas Regency, Central Java, on July 30, 2024, n.d.
- Interview and Data Collected from Mr. A.S., S.Ag., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at UIB, Bandung City, West Java, on July 22, 2024, n.d.
- Interview and Data Collected from Mr. D.A., M.H., as a Lecturer at UIBB, Cirebon, West Java, on July 20, 2024, n.d.
- Interview and Data Collected from Mr. D.P., M.Pd.I., as a Lecturer at UNA, Cilacap, Central Java, on July 18, 2024, n.d.
- Interview and Data Collected from Mr. D.S., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at STAI MT, West Java, on July 25, 2024, n.d.
- Interview and Data Collected from Mr. H., S.Sy., M.H., as a Lecturer at INU T, West Java, on July 8, 2024, n.d.

- Interview and Data Collected from Mr. H.M.P., M.H., as a Lecturer at STAI AF, Cicalengka, Bandung, West Java, on July 12, 2024., n.d.
- Interview and Data Collected from Mr. I.H., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at STIT AF, West Java, on July 28, 2024, n.d.
- Interview and Data Collected from Mr. I.U.T., S.H., M.H., as a Lecturer at UPPB, Medan City, North Sumatra, on July 10, 2024, n.d.
- Interview and Data Collected from Mr. M.H., M.H., as a Lecturer at IAI F, Kediri, East Java, on July 12, 2024, n.d.
- Interview and Data Collected from Mr. M.S.H., S.Pd., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at IMHA, West Java, on July 20, 2024, n.d.
- Interview and Data Collected from Mr. U.H., S.H.I., M.H., as a Lecturer at STAI BA, Ciparay, Bandung, West Java, on July 15, 2024., n.d.
- Interview and Data Collected from Mr. U.I.M., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at INU C, West Java, on July 5, 2024., n.d.
- Interview and Data Collected from Mr. Z.Z., M.Ag., as a Lecturer at IKH, Sukabumi City, West Java, on July 15, 2024, n.d.
- Interview and Data Collected from Mrs. D.F., S.Ag., S.H., M.E.Sy., as a Lecturer at STAI DAM, Garut, West Java, on July 25, 2024., n.d.
- Interview and Data Collected from Mrs. D.N., S.E.I., M.Ak., M.E., as a Lecturer at STESy NU, Bengkulu City, Bengkulu Province, on July 6, 2024, n.d.
- Interview and Data Collected from Mrs. E.N.L., S.Sy., M.H., as a Lecturer at UM, Tasikmalaya Regency, West Java, on July 15, 2024., n.d.
- Interview and Data Collected from Mrs. P.F., M.Pd., as a Lecturer at STIT L, Ciamis, West Java, on July 10, 2024., n.d.
- Johan, Suwinto, and Luo Yuan Yuan. "What Does Financial Institution Termination of Employment Mean in Terms of Labor Law?" *Volksgeist: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum Dan Konstitusi*, June 28, 2023, 49–59. <https://doi.org/10.24090/volksgeist.v6i1.6372>.
- Joseph, Horace William Brindley. *The Labour Theory of Value in Karl Marx*. Oxford University Press, H. Milford, 1923.
- Kamuli, Fahmi, Tunggul Anshari, and Istislam Istislam. "Regional Head's Authority In Determining Mutation Of Government Employees." *Jambura Law Review* 3, no. 1 (2021): 37–54. <https://doi.org/10.33756/jlr.v3i1.7520>.
- Kei, Lok Huey, Nur A'Alia Atierah Binti Bakri, Phoo Qiao Lin, Huda Khalidah Binti Khairunizan, Koo Huang Qing Yuan, and Nazirah Binti Mohamad Abdullah. "Mitigating Human-Elephant Conflict: A Comprehensive Review of Strategies for Sustainable Coexistence in Support of SDG 15." *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 2 (2024): e02756–e02756. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n02.pe02756>.
- Kunarti, Siti, Sri Wahyu Handayani, Riris Ardhanariswari, and Faisal Faisal. "Perspective

- of Employment Relations and Wages in Labor Law and Islamic Law.” *Samarah: Jurnal Hukum Keluarga Dan Hukum Islam* 8, no. 1 (March 31, 2024): 386–402. <https://doi.org/10.22373/sjhgk.v8i1.17045>.
- Kunarti, Siti, Nur Putri Hidayah, Hariyanto Hariyanto, and Muhammad Bahrul Ulum. “The Legal Politics of Outsourcing and Its Implication for the Protection of Workers in Indonesia.” *Sriwijaya Law Review* 8, no. 1 (January 31, 2024): 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.28946/slrev.Vol8.Iss1.2750.pp1-19>.
- Kustiana, Septi, Puji Sulistyaningsih, Dakum, and Tsuroyyaa Maitsaa’Jaudah. “Legal Protection of Land Assets of Waqf Muhammadiyah and Nahdlatul Ulama in Magelang District.” *Ijtihad* 18, no. 1 (June 15, 2024). <https://doi.org/10.21111/ijtihad.v18i1.12484>.
- Langille, Brian. “Labour Law’s Theory of Justice.” In *The Idea of Labour Law*, edited by Guy Davidov and Brian Langille, 0. Oxford University Press, 2011. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199693610.003.0008>.
- Lathif, Agus Munjirin Mukhotib, Andrey Kotyazhov, and Aliyeva Patimat Shapiulaevna. “Protecting Family Integrity from Digital Fraud: Islamic Family Law and ITE Law in WhatsApp Groups.” *Jurnal Munakahat* 1, no. 1 (December 24, 2024): 44–54.
- Lintang, Loresta Cahyaning, Adriano Martufi, and J. W. Ouwerker. “The Alternative Concepts of Blasphemy Law in Indonesia: Legal Comparison with Ireland and Canada.” *BESTUUR* 9, no. 1 (August 12, 2021): 13–25. <https://doi.org/10.20961/bestuur.v9i1.51632>.
- Loong, Shona. “The Neoliberal Borderscape: Neoliberalism’s Effects on the Social Worlds of Migrants along the Thai-Myanmar Border.” *Political Geography* 74 (October 1, 2019): 102035. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.polgeo.2019.102035>.
- Marwan, Awaludin, Diana Odier-Contreras Garduño, and Fiammetta Bonfigli. “Detection of Digital Law Issues and Implication for Good Governance Policy in Indonesia.” *BESTUUR* 10, no. 1 (August 6, 2022): 22–32. <https://doi.org/10.20961/bestuur.v10i1.59143>.
- Marwanto, I. Nyoman Prabu Buana Rumiarta, Meliana Putri, I. Wayan Parsa, and I. Gede Yusa. “Business on Nickel Downstreaming with China and European Union Lawsuits.” *Jurnal IUS Kajian Hukum dan Keadilan* 12, no. 2 (August 29, 2024): 315–29. <https://doi.org/10.29303/ius.v12i2.1381>.
- Maskur, Ali, Muslich Shabir, Abu Hapsin, Daud Rismansa, and Joko Purwanto. “Optimizing Legal Protection: Addressing the Disparity of Sanctions Regarding Personal Names in Birth Certificates as Population Documents.” *Volksgeist: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum Dan Konstitusi*, June 1, 2024, 21–33. <https://doi.org/10.24090/volksgeist.v7i1.10521>.
- Maulana, M. Hafizh, Daffa Akmal Manurung, Abdilbar Alfahrizi, and Syahrul Agil. “Analisis Hukum Ketenagakerjaan Di Indonesia.” *Jurnal Cendikia ISNU SU* 1, no. 2 (September 30, 2024): 139–46.
- Mitchell, Matthew. “Analyzing the Law Qualitatively.” *Qualitative Research Journal* 23, no. 1 (September 9, 2022): 102–13. <https://doi.org/10.1108/QRJ-04-2022-0061>.

- Mucharom, Rully Syahrul, Toto Tohir Suriaamadja, Ratna Januarita, Belardo Prasetya Mega Jaya, Dwi Gita Maharani, and Asari Taufiqurrohman. "WTO Subsidies Agreement on Fisheries (2022-2024): Agreed Terms and Implications for Indonesia." *Jurnal IUS Kajian Hukum Dan Keadilan* 12, no. 2 (August 28, 2024): 285–99. <https://doi.org/10.29303/ius.v12i2.1394>.
- Muda Harahap, Arifuddin, Mar'ie Mahfudz Harahap, Rahmad Efendi, Mhd Nurhusein Daulay, and Muhammad Hazim Ahmad. "Challenges and Problems in Labour Law from the Perspectives of Indonesia and Malaysia." *Malaysian Journal of Syariah and Law* 12, no. 3 (December 1, 2024): 535–49. <https://doi.org/10.33102/mjssl.vol12no3.1037>.
- Muhammad, Zakiyyu, and Yogi Triswandani. "Zakat and Marketing: Innovative Approaches to Enhance Zakat Distribution in Jigawa State, Nigeria." *Jurnal Munakahat* 1, no. 1 (December 12, 2024). <https://ejournal.kampusalazhar.ac.id/index.php/JMK/article/view/17>.
- Mutmainah, Naeli, Muharir Muharir, Farhatun Sa'diyah, Dien Kalpika Kasih, Hasanah Abd Khafid, and Sérgio António Neves Lousada. "Maqā'id Al-Sharāh in the Digital Era: Challenges in Islamic Family Law and Halal Lifestyle in Indonesia." *Jurnal Munakahat* 1, no. 1 (December 12, 2024). <https://ejournal.kampusalazhar.ac.id/index.php/JMK/article/view/17>.
- Mutmainah, Naeli, Encep Taufik Rahman, Hisam Ahyani, Md Yazid Ahmad, Sérgio António Neves Lousada, and Ma E. Dunur'aeni. "Religious Moderation Approach through Islamic Family Law and Siyasa Fiqh: Challenges of the Digital Era in Banjar City, West Java, Indonesia." *Jurnal Munakahat* 1, no. 1 (December 24, 2024): 11–21.
- Naisabur, Nanang, Haris Maiza Putra, Hisam Ahyani, Dwi Novita, and Pat Kurniati. "The Prohibition of Social E-Commerce on TikTok Shop: A Fiqh Examination Based on Sharia Compliance and Economic Justice." *Al-Manahij: Jurnal Kajian Hukum Islam*, March 25, 2024, 59–78. <https://doi.org/10.24090/mnh.v18i1.9674>.
- Nita, Surya. "The Legal Position of Lecturer at University Which Incorporated as Foundation in Indonesia." *Yustisia* 5, no. 3 (December 28, 2016): 702–14. <https://doi.org/10.20961/yustisia.v5i3.8810>.
- Paratama, Faradillah, Anshori Ilyas, Syamsul Bachri, and Zulkifli Aspan. "Reconstructing Civil Service Recruitment Policies in Indonesia: Ensuring Justice and Equity in Regional ASN Procurement Aligned with SDG 8 And SDG 10." *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 1 (2024): e03100–e03100. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n01.pe03100>.
- Rahman, Rofi Aulia, Jozsef Hajdu, and Valentino Nathanael. "Digital Labour Platformer's Legal Status and Decent Working Conditions: European Union and Indonesian Perspective." *Volksgeist: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum Dan Konstitusi*, 2024. <https://doi.org/10.24090/volksgeist.v7i1.10366>.
- Rawls, John. *A Theory of Justice*. Harvard University Press, 2009.
- Resty, Andina, Dea Fadila, Farida Hanum Fajrianti, Annisa Octavia, Khairul Ali

- Harahap, and Aldris Mulya Putra. "Pertanggung Jawaban Perusahaan Dalam Kecelakaan Kerja." *Jurnal Cendikia ISNU SU* 1, no. 2 (September 30, 2024): 75–77.
- Retnowulandari, Wahyuni, Maria Silvya Elisabeth Wangga, Maya Indrasti Notoprayitno, and Nadzriah Ahmad. "The Prevalence Of Child Marriage: Comparative Study Of Indonesia And Other South Asian States." *Jambura Law Review* 6, no. 2 (July 24, 2024): 339–66. <https://doi.org/10.33756/jlr.v6i2.24257>.
- Rojas, Mariano, Alfonso Méndez, and Karen Watkins-Fassler. "The Hierarchy of Needs Empirical Examination of Maslow's Theory and Lessons for Development." *World Development* 165 (May 1, 2023): 106185. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2023.106185>.
- Rosyidah, Umu, Ery Tri Djatmika, Cipto Wardoyo, Nurika Restuningdiah, and Budi Eko Soetjipto. "Unleashing Innovation Potential: The Role of Human Capital and Digital Capability to Increase Firm Performance for Sustainable Development Goals (SDGS) in Lombok Island." *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 1 (2024): e02670–e02670. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n01.pe02670>.
- Sand, Inger-Johanne. "What Is the Function of Welfare Law Today? Consequences of the Work-Line Policy." In *Transformations of European Welfare States and Social Rights: Regulation, Professionals, and Citizens*, edited by Stine Piilgaard Porner Nielsen and Ole Hammerslev, 41–59. Cham: Springer Nature Switzerland, 2024. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-46637-3_3.
- Solehudin, Ending, Sérgio António Neves Lousada, Supaprawat Siripipatthanakul, José Manuel Naranjo Gómez, and Dainora Jankauskienė. "Legal Uncertainty in Indonesia's Mining Sector: Impact on Business, Inheritance, and Asset Division Challenges." *Jurnal Munakahat* 1, no. 1 (December 24, 2024): 55–66.
- Sudiarawan, Kadek Agus, Putu Gede Arya Sumerta Yasa, Desak Putu Dewi Kasih, Nyoman Satyayudha Dananjaya, and Ni Ketut Devi Damayanti. "Formulation of Online Dispute Resolution in Realizing Fair Industrial Relations Dispute Settlement: A Comparative Study." *Jurnal IUS Kajian Hukum Dan Keadilan* 12, no. 2 (August 12, 2024): 227–48. <https://doi.org/10.29303/ius.v12i2.1308>.
- Surasa, Ais. "Dynamics of Critical Thinking Among Islamic Family Law Students: A Study at Stisa Ash-Shofa Manonjaya." *Jurnal Nahdlatul Fikr* 6, no. 2 (September 9, 2024): 69–80.
- Suryani, Irma, Yulnetri Yulnetri, Amrina Amrina, Ifelda Nengsih, and Daleleer Kaur Randawar. "Reformulation of Bundo Kanduang's Role in Solving Domestic Violence Cases." *Jambura Law Review* 5, no. 2 (May 31, 2023): 199–219. <https://doi.org/10.33756/jlr.v5i2.19172>.
- Suwarsono, Bambang Setiadji, Musa Asy'arie, Waston, Andri Nirwana, and Muthoifin. "The Future of the Civilization of the Ummah Is Reviewed from the Sociology of Education for the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG'S)." *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 4, no. 1 (July 29, 2024): e01688–e01688. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v4.n00.pe01688>.

- Tanjung, Indra Utama, Mhd Syahnan, and Akmaluddin Syahputra. "Political and Legal Reconstruction of the Urgency That Forces the Issuance of PERPPU in Indonesia Based on Fair Benefit Values." *Pena Justisia: Media Komunikasi Dan Kajian Hukum* 23, no. 3 (December 19, 2024): 1065–79. <https://doi.org/10.31941/pj.v23i3.5495>.
- Vickers, Ros. "The Regulation of Natural Resources Law in Australia for Indigenous People." *Jambe Law Journal* 2, no. 2 (2019): 99–117. <https://doi.org/10.22437/jlj.2.2.99-117>.
- Wang, Liudan, Rasheedul Haque, Natalia Hakimi, and Chen Guanyu. "Examining Digital Talent Acquisition and Recruitment Strategies to Enhance Economic Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) Of SME'S in China's Internet Industry." *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 4, no. 3 (September 20, 2024): e02306–e02306. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v4.n03.pe02306>.
- Yanuary, Dina. "University Leaders Forum, 172 PTS Jabar-Banten Konsolidasi Tingkatkan Mutu Pendidikan." *LLDIKTI Wilayah 4* (blog), October 21, 2024. <https://lldikti4.kemdikbud.go.id/2024/10/university-leaders-forum-172-pts-jabar-banten-konsolidasi-tingkatkan-mutu-pendidikan/>.
- Zarkasyi, Hamid Fahmy, Fuad Mas'ud, Khoirul Umam, Rakhmad Agung Hidayatullah, and Usmanul Khakim. "Developing an Islamic Human Resource Development Mode (IHRD) to Strengthen the Organization's Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)." *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 1 (2024): e03289–e03289. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n01.pe03289>.
- Zhaslan, Smagulov, Amurtaeva Dinara, Temirzhanova Lyazzat, Kussainova Larissa, and Dulatbekov Nurlan. "Public Prosecutor's Supervision Over the Observation of Citizens' Labor Rights." *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review* 5, no. 2 (2025): e2852–e2852. <https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n02.pe02852>.