

[IJPVM]:Article for revision:IJPVM_106_20

International Journal of Preventive Medicine <editor_ijpvm@medknow.com>

Mon 3/30/2020 2:18 PM

To: Kusuma, Dian <d.kusuma@imperial.ac.uk>

This email from editor_ijpvm@medknow.com originates from outside Imperial. Do not click on links and attachments unless you recognise the sender. If you trust the sender, add them to your [safe senders list](#) to disable email stamping for this address.

If you cannot see this page properly, please [click here](#).

Dear Dr. Kusuma

With reference to your manuscript entitled 'Implementation of the smoke-free policy in Medan City, Indonesia: Compliance and challenges', please review the comments of the referees from our site <https://www.journalonweb.com/ijpvm>. The manuscript would be reconsidered after requisite modifications as per the comments and instructions provided by the journal.

If you wish to continue with the publication process, kindly make the changes according to the comments and upload the revised manuscript from the site along with the point to point clarifications to the comments indicating clearly where in the manuscript the changes have been carried out. Do check the FAQ related to replying to the comments and uploading a file. The contributors' form/images should be sent separately to the Administrative Office of the journal.

The journal allows four weeks for the revision of the manuscript. If we do not hear from you within this period, we will consider it your non-desire to continue the article with us. Please also note that submission of revised article does not guarantee its final acceptance by the journal.

We thank you for submitting your valuable research work to International Journal of Preventive Medicine.

With warm personal regards,

Editorial Team

International Journal of Preventive Medicine

Remarks:

[REVIEWER]:

Introduction: Please add the population of Indonesia - it is unclear from the figure for current smokers as to what the smoking prevalence is and how this is a high rate compared to other countries worldwide, particularly among men. Please provide further clarification about the Smoke Free Policy (SFP). It is unclear if these restrictions are indoor only at selected facilities. Further, it requires clarification as to whether vaping products are included in this definition.

It would also be helpful to add a reference to the WHO Framework for Convention on Tobacco Control - Indonesia is notable as one of the countries which has not signed. There are inconsistencies and errors in grammar throughout the manuscript including the introduction. "An SFP" should be "A SFP". It is unclear then the SFP bill passed through parliament - please clarify this.

Methods: It is appreciated that a purposive sampling strategy was necessary for logistical reasons but was any stratification used to identify how many of each facility should be selected? What are the total number of each of these facilities (e.g. hospitals) and therefore what was the coverage of the sample? Further information is required to describe how the quantitative data were collected - was this done by questionnaire? In-person or online? What approaches were used to minimise risk of bias? Were observations undertaken at each site and by whom? How were data gathered and entered? Please provide further clarification of the selection of 1-kilometre buffers for the spatial analyses. Please also describe how key respondents were identified and what was the analytical approach for qualitative data analyses? To address all the above queries it would be beneficial to complete a STROBE checklist for observational studies.

RESULTS: Please add confidence intervals for the overall percentages reported. The final paragraph in the results section should be in the discussion/

DISCUSSION : What was the baseline referred to in the first two sentences when the SPF compliance is described as "lower"? It would also strengthen the discussion if strengths and limitations of the cross-sectional study design could be considered. Further, the strengths and limitations of this approach require further detail.

Message sent on Monday, March 30, 2020

Please add editor_ijpvm@medknow.com as a contact in your E-mail client to ensure that this mail is not considered as a junk mail.

----- END OF MESSAGE -----