



Nurussakinah Daulay <nurussakinah@uinsu.ac.id>

[IGCJ] Invitation to review a scientific journal article

4 pesan

IGC Journal <igcjournal@gmail.com>

21 Juni 2021 12.50

Kepada: nurussakinah@uinsu.ac.id

Dear Dr. Nurussakinah Daulay, M.Psi, Psikolog,

My name is Aprezo Pardodi Maba from Indonesia. I am the editor in chief of [Islamic Guidance and Counseling Journal](#) (2614-1566). The journal has been indexed by **Scopus** and **Accredited** by Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education of the Republic of Indonesia.

We have just received a manuscript about Spirituality and Empathy Among Indonesian Muslim Pre-Service Teachers which is relevant to your research interest. Through this email, I would like to invite you to review the manuscript.

If you accept this invitation, I would love provide you a Certificate as a reviewer from our Publisher (Institut Agama Islam Ma'arif NU Metro Lampung, Indonesia) and email of Review Acknowledgement to claim the record in [Publons](#). Please note that the review itself is due in 2 weeks.

For your consideration, here I attach the title and the abstract. Once you are available for review I will send you the full text of the manuscript.

I know you are very busy, so thank you for responding to my email. I look forward to your kind response.

Best wishes,

Aprezo Pardodi Maba, M.Pd

aprezopm@gmail.com | aprezo@iainmetrolampung.ac.id

Editor in Chief

<https://journal.iainmetrolampung.ac.id/index.php/igcj>**A Multi-Dimensional Exploration of Spirituality to Empathy Among Indonesian Muslim Pre-Service Teachers****Abstract**

Although many studies have examined the relationship between spirituality and empathy, very few studies have focused on exploring a multi-dimensional relationship between variables, especially in the Muslim pre-service teachers' area. This study examined the influence of spiritual dimensions on empathy for Muslim pre-service teachers by considering the aspects of age, gender, and years of formal education. Empathy has four dimensions; emphatic concern, personal distress, perspective taking, and fantasy, likewise spirituality also has four dimensions; meaning of purpose, innerness, interconnectedness, and transcendence. Using the random sampling technique, the respondents were 376 from 27 universities in East Java, Indonesia. The results showed that the fantasy decreased with increasing age. On the other hand, men have higher score of personal distress and fantasy than women. Amazingly, the empathy in all dimensions and meaning of purpose in spirituality increase with increasing years of formal education. All dimensions of empathy affect some spiritual dimensions. Personal distress on empathy affects the spiritual dimension the most; the meaning of purpose, interconnectedness, and transcendence. Meanwhile, the interconnectedness dimension of spirituality is influenced by the most empathy dimension; emphatic concern, personal distress, and fantasy. This study's findings help plan counseling at universities, especially for Muslim pre-service teachers, by involving spirituality elements to increase empathy. Integrating Islamic values is also an essential alternative in counseling for Muslims.

Keywords: empathy, Muslim, pre-service teacher, spirituality, and university

Nurussakinah Daulay <nurussakinah@uinsu.ac.id>

21 Juni 2021 17.41

Kepada: IGC Journal <igcjournal@gmail.com>

Dear Mr. Aprezo Pardodi Maba, M.Pd

Editor in Chief in Islamic Guidance and Counseling Journal

I express my deepest gratitude for the trust placed in me.

I will be happy to review the manuscript with the title “**A Multi-Dimensional Exploration of Spirituality to Empathy Among Indonesian Muslim Pre-Service Teachers**”

I will review it seriously and soon I will send it back to the journal.

Thank you very much for your kindness

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]


IGC Journal <igcjournal@gmail.com>
Kepada: Nurussakinah Daulay <nurussakinah@uinsu.ac.id>

21 Juni 2021 18.56

Dear Dr. Nurussakinah Daulay, M.Psi, Psikolog,

Thank you so much for your kind response. Please find the fulltext in attached document.

Best wishes,
Aprezo Pardodi Maba
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

 **1553-Article Text-6436-1-4-20210615.docx**
120K

Nurussakinah Daulay <nurussakinah@uinsu.ac.id>
Kepada: IGC Journal <igcjournal@gmail.com>


25 Juni 2021 22.04

Dear Mr. Aprezo Pardodi Maba, M.Pd

I have reviewed this manuscript, there are several advantages but also need to be revised according to suggestions so that this manuscript is better.

Thank you for trusting me, I am very happy to be able to join as a reviewer in this prestigious journal.

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

 **ok. 1553.docx**
107K

A Multi-Dimensional Exploration of Spirituality to Empathy Among Indonesian Muslim Pre-Service Teachers

Abstract

Although many studies have examined the relationship between spirituality and empathy, very few studies have focused on exploring a multi-dimensional relationship between variables, especially in the Muslim pre-service teachers' area. This study examined the influence of spiritual dimensions on empathy for Muslim pre-service teachers by considering the aspects of age, gender, and years of formal education. Empathy has four dimensions; emphatic concern, personal distress, perspective taking, and fantasy, likewise spirituality also has four dimensions; meaning of purpose, innerness, interconnectedness, and transcendence. Using the random sampling technique, the respondents were 376 from 27 universities in East Java, Indonesia. The results showed that the fantasy decreased with increasing age. On the other hand, men have higher score of personal distress and fantasy than women. Amazingly, the empathy in all dimensions and meaning of purpose in spirituality increase with increasing years of formal education. All dimensions of empathy affect some spiritual dimensions. Personal distress on empathy affects the spiritual dimension the most; the meaning of purpose, interconnectedness, and transcendence. Meanwhile, the interconnectedness dimension of spirituality is influenced by the most empathy dimension; emphatic concern, personal distress, and fantasy. This study's findings help plan counseling at universities, especially for Muslim pre-service teachers, by involving spirituality elements to increase empathy. Integrating Islamic values is also an essential alternative in counseling for Muslims.

Keywords: empathy, Muslim, pre-service teacher, spirituality, and university

INTRODUCTION

Empathy has a pivotal role in learning, and prospective teachers are an asset that is the main element in determining education's success. Many teachers cannot perceive learning situations based on students' perceptions or egocentricity, causing learning objectives not to work optimally. Especially during the Covid-19 pandemic, most learning uses online learning approach, various online learning platforms, such as Google Classroom, Facebook, WhatsApp, Google Met, etc. are used in learning (Jannah et al., 2021; Kusumaning Ayu et al., 2019; Ngussa et al., 2021).

Unfortunately, some people mention that online learning causes students to be bored (Fatimah, 2020). Besides, financial problems in the cost of education affect students' psychological condition (Nardha, 2020). This situation requires high empathy, especially for teachers to their students. This is justified by the fact that high scores for empathy correlate positively with low levels of violence in school (Espejo-Siles et al., 2020).

This study defines empathy as understanding thoughts from the other person's point of view and how the other persons feel (Rogers, 1956). Empathy is crucial to use when dealing with unexpected situations. Therefore, teacher need to invite students to do self-talk on how to deal with unexpected situations (Hall & Smotrova, 2013). Through empathizing, prospective teachers can learn to protect students from negative emotions (Jaber et al., 2018; Kurniasih et al., 2020). Therefore,, education is needed for pre-service teachers to get empowered with ability to increase empathy toward the learners (Jaber et al., 2018; Setiyowati et al., 2019; Suryandari et al., 2016; Taufiq & Herdi, 2020). However, not much has been discussed on how educational interventions can improve pre-service teacher's empathy, which is an important aspect for learners to succeed in their academic journey.

Commented [A1]: The reference used from Jannah and Kusumaning does not accurately describe online learning

Commented [A2]: It is advisable to cite based on reputable international journals (eg Scopus) for the last 10 years.

Commented [A3]: Same as above, Should cite based on reputable international journals (eg: Scopus) for the last 10 years

In recent years, there has been an increasing interest in correlation research between empathy and spirituality. Students' spirituality is proven to be able to increase their commitment and professional attitude (Chiang et al., 2020; Ross et al., 2018). This commitment and professionalism are significant in supporting the professionalism of pre-service teachers. In addition, previous research results suggest that spirituality has benefits in increasing well-being which could be a solution to one's psychological problems (DePue & Lambie, 2014; Feizi et al., 2020; Amos Lal et al., 2020; Palmer Kelly et al., 2020; Prosek et al., 2020; Woollacott et al., 2020). On the other hand, spirituality is an essential component in shaping a holistic university curriculum (Cruz et al., 2017). Therefore, it is important to improve not only students', but also that of teachers' spirituality.

When spirituality is associated with empathy, most of previous studies results show a positive relationship (Fitriyah et al., 2020; Hardy et al., 2012; A. Lal et al., 2020; Moloney & Gair, 2015; Stewart & Lawrence, 2020). But researchers have not treated the variables in much detail. However, there is still uncertainty whether each variable's tendency is influenced by their demographic profile such as gender, age, and years of education. According to researchers' knowledge, there has been no detailed investigation of the correlation between spirituality and empathy (Giordano et al., 2014; Hotoleanu & Dumitrascu, 2016), especially in the Muslim community context. This study has been propelled by the fact that religious and cultural backgrounds greatly influence community behavior (Babarin, 1993; Hefti, 2011; Johnson et al., 2011; Counted, Possamai, & Meade, 2018), and therefore, this study's topic was deemed necessary.

This study aimed to: (1) Examine the spiritual dimensions of Muslim pre-service teachers and discuss their relation to demographic characteristics such as gender and age. (2) Test the dimensions of empathy for Muslim pre-service teachers and discuss their relationship with

demographic characteristics such as gender, age, and length of study. (3) Verify whether and to what extent the spiritual dimensions affect the empathy dimensions of the Muslim pre-service teacher.

This study provided new insights into demographics variables roles in relation to spirituality dimensions and empathy. It sought to explore the profile of spirituality and empathy among the Muslim pre-service teachers from 27 universities in East Java, Indonesia. While previous studies only discussed the correlation between variables, they slightly involved the role of gender and age (Giordano et al., 2014; Hotoleanu & Dumitrascu, 2016). Thus, this study adds to the literature by focusing on demographic characteristics' role in the interaction in the context of the pre-service teachers.

Commented [A4]: 1.Add the reason why only revealing the demographics of the respondents, namely gender and age. So it is important to disclose in this study.
2.Add research hypothesis

METHODS

Procedure

Participants in this study were voluntary without any reward. Ethics approval was sought with ethical clearance number 237 / EC / KEPK / UNUSA / 2020. Muslim pre-service undergraduate students – from a university in East Java, Indonesia filled out an online questionnaire, which was distributed through the WhatsApp group of each university. The researchers asked participants to fill out the questionnaire to measure spirituality, empathy, and demographic characteristic through the google form service for two weeks. Out of 500 expected respondents, 376 completed and returned the questionnaire, and therefore the response rate was 75.2%.

Commented [A5]: In the research method, important points are made:
1. Research Design
2. Participants
3. Procedure
4.Data Collection
5.Data analysis

Participants

376 students from 27 universities in East Java were respondents in this study. Most respondents came from the city of Surabaya 46%, and the rest came from other cities in East Java Province.

Table 1 shows the demographic characteristics, in terms of age, gender, and years of formal education.

Table 1. Demographic characteristics details of respondents

	n (%)	Age	
		Range	mean \pm SD
Respondents by gender			
Male	65 (17.29%)	17 - 50	21.46 \pm 4.19
Female	311 (82.71%)	18 - 57	21.85 \pm 5.61
Respondents by years of formal education			
13 years	99 (26.33%)	17 – 39	20.16 \pm 3.43
14 years	124 (32.98%)	19 – 45	20.75 \pm 3.42
15 years	112 (119.149%)	19 – 50	22.81 \pm 6.45
16 years	41 (10.90%)	20 – 57	26.00 \pm 8.28

Instruments

The questionnaire package included demographic characteristics. This measuring instrument was chosen because its psychometric properties are equally strong with the Indonesian sample in terms of validity and reliability.

To measure the spirituality variable, we used the Spirituality Assessment Scale (SAS), while to measure the empathy variable we used the Interpersonal Reactivity Index (IRI). Both questionnaires were originally in English, so they needed an adaptation process into Indonesian

before being used. The adaptation process follows WHO standards; forward translation, expert panel Back-translation, pre-testing and cognitive interviewing, and final version (WHO, 2021).

Spirituality

Spirituality dimensions were measured using the Indonesian version of the Spirituality Assessment Scale (SAS), a 28-items questionnaire, separated into four subscales; meaning of purpose, innerness, interconnectedness, and transcendence (Howden, 1992). Previous research had tested the validity and reliability of this assessment tool (Peng & Chen, 2014; Smith & Gordon, 2005). Respondents were asked to indicate how much each item describes them on a 4-point Likert scale ranging from 1 (“does not describe me well”) to 4 (“describes me very well”). The SAS scores showed acceptable reliability with Cronbach's alpha levels as follows: meaning of purpose = 0.71, innerness = 0.78, interconnectedness = 0.68, and transcendence = 0.77. All of Cronbach's alpha levels are greater than R table (0.182) (Heppner, 2008).

Commented [A6]: Add how the results of the validity and reliability test of the construct on the spirituality instrument

Empathy

Empathic dimensions were measured using the Indonesian version of the Interpersonal Reactivity Index (IRI). A 28-items questionnaire separated into four subscales namely empathic concern, fantasy, personal distress and perspective-taking (Davis, 1980). The questionnaire used had been tested for validity and reliability in various countries, such as Italia (Ardenghi et al., 2020), Dutch (Corte et al., 2007), French (Gilet et al., 2013), and USA (Murphy et al., 2020). In this questionnaire, respondents were asked to indicate how much each item describes them on a 4-point Likert scale ranging from 1 (“does not describe me well”) to 4 (“describes me very well”). In the current study, the IRI scores showed acceptable reliability with the following Cronbach's alpha levels: empathic concern = 0.79, personal distress = 0.74, perspective-taking = 0.69, and fantasy

Commented [A7]: Add how the results of the validity and reliability test of the construct on the empathy instrument

= 0.75, which are greater than the R table (0.182) and also above from the A suggested minimum score for social science research (Heppner, 2008).

Data Analysis

The quantitative data was analyzed by using IBM SPSS Version 24.0 for Windows. All data was partitioned for skewness and kurtosis to test for normality assumptions (Tabachnick & Fidell, 2000). Demographic characteristics were analyzed through descriptive statistic. Then, the researchers examined the association between study variables by calculating Pearson's partial correlations controlling for gender, age, and years of education. T-test analysis and Cohen's calculations (Cohen, 1977) were applied to explore gender differences in pre-service teachers' spiritual dimension. To test the spiritual dimension's role as a predictor of empathy scores, the researchers performed a separate hierarchical multiple regression for each IRI subscale, adopting a two-block strategy with the enter method. Gender, age and year of completing education were entered in Step 1 of the regression model to control the effect of confounding demographic factors. To avoid the multicollinearity problem, the spiritual dimension (SAS subscale) was entered separately in Step 2 to determine whether the inclusion of the SAS scale in each regression model would increase the total unexplained variance IRI dimension. The statistically significant variation in the F (DF) value and the coefficient of determination (DR2) at Step 2 means that the SAS scale's inclusion in the regression model explains the IRI dimension's additional variance. Results were considered statistically significant at p-value <0.05.

Commented [A8]: Data analysis must refer to the research hypothesis

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Results

Demographic characteristics and descriptive statistics for empathy and spiritual dimensions

A total of 376 Muslim pre-service teachers (75.2%) from 27 universities attending a faculty of education in East Java, Indonesia, participated in this study. Table 2 shows the demographics characteristics, the statistics of spiritual dimensions and empathy variables.

Table 2. Summary of means (M), standard deviations (SD), and observed range for study measures.

Aspects	Female (N=311, 82.7%)		Male (N=65, 17.3%)		Total (N=376, 100%)		Observed Range (min-max)
	M	SD	M	SD	M	SD	
Age (years)	21.46	4.19	21.85	5.70	21.78	5.46	17.00 – 57.00
SAS-MP	13.02	1.82	12.74	1.44	12.79	1.51	4.00 – 16.00
SAS-IN	27.02	.24	26.69	3.01	26.75	3.25	10.00 – 36.00
SAS-IT	28.26	3.81	27.89	2.80	27.95	2.99	11.00 – 36.00
SAS-TS	15.09	2.66	15.04	2.01	15.05	2.13	6.00 – 21.00
IRI-EC	18.34	2.40	18.75	1.67	18.68	1.82	7.00 – 25.00
IRI-PD	23.55	3.22	24.52	2.18	24.35	2.41	9.00 – 31.00
IRI-PT	17.77	2.28	17.81	1.80	17.80	1.89	7.00 – 24.00
IRI-FS	18.62	3.07	19.83	2.39	19.62	2.56	8.00 – 27.00

SAS-MP Meaning of Purpose, SAS-IN Innerness, SAS-IT Interconnectedness, SAS-TS Transcendence; IRI-EC Empathic Concern, IRI-PD Personal Distress, IRI-PT Perspective-taking, IRI-F Fantasy.

Gender, age, years of formal education differences in the association of spiritual dimensions and empathy in pre-service teachers

For the overall sample, there was a significant gender effect for IRI-PD ($t = -2.967$; $p = 0.003$) and IRI-FS ($t = -3.547$; $p = 0.000$), with male pre-service teachers being more empathetic than female. Pearson product-moment correlations showed a small but significant inverse correlation between pre-service teachers' age and their IRI-FS ($r = -0.151$; $p = 0.003$). The negative correlation shows that the higher a person's age, the lower the empathy on the fantasy dimension. On the other hand, the study's results proved that the higher the pre-service teacher years' of completing formal education, the higher their empathy ($F = 3.236$; $p = 0.013$). Likewise, in the SAS-MP dimension, the higher the pre-service teacher years' of completing formal education, the higher their meaning of purpose ($F = 2.884$; $p = 0.023$).

Associations between spiritual dimensions and empathy measures

Table 3 shows the partial correlations between spirituality and empathy measures, controlled for gender, age, and years of education variables. The IRI-EC dimension found that the SAS-TS dimension had the highest correlation compared to other spiritual dimensions ($r = 0.235$). Then on the IRI-PD dimension, the highest correlation was obtained in the SAS-TS dimension ($r = 0.776$). In the IRI-PT dimension, it is found that the SAS-IN dimension ($r = 0.455$) and SAS-MP ($r = 0.431$) are the highest spiritual dimensions that correlate to the IRI-PT dimension. The last dimension of empathy is IRI-FS. The highest spirituality dimension of SAS-IT ($r = 0.291$) is connected. Meanwhile, when viewed based on the empathy variable, the IRI-PD dimension has a high correlation value if correlated with the overall spirituality dimension.

Table 3. Partial correlations between spiritual and empathy dimensions controlled for gender and age

Variable	SAS- MP	SAS- IN	SAS- IT	SAS- TS	IRI-EC	IRI-PD	IRI-PT	IRI-FS
SAS-MP	1.000	0.605	0.653	0.401	0.172	0.469	0.431	0.242
SAS-IN		1.000	0.627	0.578	0.188	0.546	0.455	0.244
SAS-IT			1.000	0.393	0.235	0.500	0.383	0.291
SAS-TS				1.000	0.127	0.776	0.289	0.186
IRI-EC					1.000	0.342	0.386	0.379
IRI-PD						1.000	0.436	0.453
IRI-PT							1.000	0.307
IRI-FS								1.000

SAS-MP Meaning of Purpose, SAS-IN Innerness, SAS-IT Interconnectedness, SAS-TS Transcendence; IRI-EC Empathic Concern, IRI-PD Personal Distress, IRI-PT Perspective-taking, IRI-F Fantasy; $p < .001$.

What stands out in table 4 is hierarchical multiple regression analysis, which is accomplished to examine the unique involvement of each of the four aspects of spirituality in explaining the variance of empathy dimensions, controlling for the effect of gender, age and years of formal education.

Table 4. Hierarchical multiple regression analyses summary for spirituality predicting empathy dimensions

	IRI-EC			IRI-PD			IRI-PT			IRI-F		
	ΔF	p	ΔR^2	ΔF	p	ΔR^2	ΔF	p	ΔR^2	ΔF	p	ΔR^2
SAS- MP	5.119	0.896	0.040	39.786	0.056	0.243	28.788	0.001	0.188	15.629	0.399	0.112

SAS- IN	4.935	0.486	0.051	49.599	0.792	0.348	30.512	0.000	0.248	13.392	0.473	0.126
SAS- IT	5.384	0.009	0.068	42.976	0.000	0.367	24.598	0.332	0.249	12.491	0.006	0.144
SAS- TS	4.490	0.767	0.068	120.198	0.000	0.662	20.472	0.719	0.250	10.536	0.373	0.146

SAS-MP Meaning of Purpose, SAS-IN Innerness, SAS-IT Interconnectedness, SAS-TS Transcendence; IRI-EC Empathic Concern, IRI-PD Personal Distress, IRI-PT Perspective-taking, IRI-F Fantasy

The hierarchical multiple regression test results showed that the IRI-EC dimension significantly affected the SAS-IT dimension with an F (ΔF) value of 5.384 and a coefficient of determination (ΔR^2) of 0.068. Furthermore, the IRI-PD dimension has the most influence in the three spiritual dimensions; SAS-MP, SAS-IT, and SAS-TS, with F (ΔF) values of 39,786, 42,976, and 120,198, while the coefficient of determination (ΔR^2) is 0.243, 0.367, and 0.667. The IRI-PT dimension affects two spiritual dimensions; SAS-MP and SAS-IN with F (ΔF) values of 28,788 and 30,512, while the coefficient of determination (ΔR^2) is 0.188 and 0.248. In the last dimension, IRI-FS affects SAS-IT with an F (ΔF) value of 12,491 and a coefficient of determination (ΔR^2) of 0.144.

DISCUSSION

Several reports have shown that spirituality's role in a psychological and social context has been widely studied (Dose et al., 2014; Edwards et al., 2010; Mohan & Uys, 2006). Spirituality in the relationship between educators and students is useful as a critical psychological problem for students, so prospective teachers need to learn it (Espejo-Siles et al., 2020; Hall & Smotrova, 2013). Pre-service teachers' spirituality is one-factor affecting empathy that needs attention,

especially for universities where prospective teachers receive education in preparation for their future career (Jaber et al., 2018).

Previous research has proven that the story of the Prophet Muhammad has an impact on character education (Fitriyah & Djazilan, 2020). This reinforces the assumption that religious values greatly affect success in learning interactions. This also applies to people of other religions such as Hindus and Buddhists who believe in the values of Prince Sutasoma's journey in the Sutasoma's Book (Tantular, 2009), the journey of Jesus Christ to the Gospels, etc.

Gender, age, and years of completing formal education differences in spiritual dimensions of pre-service teachers

As mentioned in the literature review, previous research recommends researching demographic factors that affect spirituality (Frida et al., 2019). Through this research, three demographic factors were discussed: gender, age, and formal education years. **Based on the descriptive viewpoint, there is no difference in the score of spiritual dimensions and gender.** Similar finding was also reported by previous studies (Gomez & Fisher, 2005; Luna et al., 2018). However, while other studies suggest conflicting results, with men having higher spiritual scores than women (Šilingienė & Škėrienė, 2015), cultural factors from the respondents may influence this difference.

In line with the gender factor, study's results also show that age does not affect spirituality. Although the results of previous studies are in line with this study (Luna et al., 2018), other studies suggest that age has a significant effect on spirituality (Šilingienė & Škėrienė, 2015). Meanwhile, this study proves that only the fantasy aspect of empathy is visible by age, the higher a person's age, the lower the fantasy.

In contrast to gender and age, the meaning of purpose dimension increases with the length of years of formal education in pre-service teachers. This result is in line with previous research that the

Commented [A9]: Add the reasons from the results of this study that there is no difference in the spiritual dimension and gender? Why?

And the reason why the results of this study show that only fantasy is correlated with age.

educational factor has an essential effect on one's spirituality (Šilingienė & Škėrienė, 2015). On the other hand, the type of university does not affect student spirituality (Frida et al., 2019). However, given the lack of information about the study programs of students enrolled in this study, further research should also include various teacher study programs to ascertain the relationship between spirituality and pre-service teachers' study program.

Gender, age, and years of completing formal education differences in empathy of pre-service teachers

From the descriptive viewpoint, male pre-service teachers had more empathy than females, especially in personal distress and fantasy. On the other hand, previous studies show that it is precisely women who have higher personal distress and fantasy than men (Scocco et al., 2020)..

Other studies state that there is no difference between empathy for males and females, who have the same instincts in carrying out prosocial behavior (e.g. Kamas & Preston, 2020).

The study findings show that the higher the age, the lower the empathy in the fantasy dimension, meaning that the fantasy aspect of empathy is influenced by age. But in general, the results of previous studies suggest that a person's empathy increases with age (Spenser et al., 2020). Age in this study only affects the fantasy dimension of empathy, whereas previous studies examined all dimensions of empathy, so, naturally, differences in results occur.

The length of time completing formal education influences pre-service teachers' empathic concern, so that the higher the person's education level or the longer a person has formal education, the more level of empathy increases. These findings are consistent with the international works (Bingham, 2015; Can Gür & Yilmaz, 2020; Harrington & O'Connell, 2016; Maselli et al., 2019).

The relationship between pre-service teachers' empathy and spiritual dimensions

Commented [A10]: This section should explain, why are male pre service teachers more empathy than women?

A strong relationship between spirituality and empathy has been reported in the literature (Hardy et al., 2012; A. Lal et al., 2020; Moloney & Gair, 2015; Stewart & Lawrence, 2020). The project's initial objective was to identify whether and to what extent spiritual dimensions influence the dimensions of empathy in prospective teachers. The most interesting finding was that spirituality and empathy are related. The dimensions of empathic concern, personal distress and fantasy significantly predict interconnectedness. On the other hand, personal distress and perspective-taking affect the meaning of purpose. In addition, personal distress also affects transcendence and perspective-taking also affects innerness.

The results show that not a single dimension, neither spirituality nor empathy, is unrelated. Most of the previous studies which examined the relationship between spirituality and empathy (Hardy et al., 2012; A. Lal et al., 2020; Moloney & Gair, 2015; Stewart & Lawrence, 2020), explaining the role of gender, age, education very little (Giordano et al., 2014). The advantage of this study is to analyze more deeply the role of gender, age, and education in the relationship with spiritual dimensions and empathy.

One unanticipated finding was about a fantasy dimension being influenced by gender and age. Men are more likely to have higher fantasies than girls, and the higher the age of a person, the dimension of fantasy in them decreases. This could mean that when the fantasy dimension in a person decreases with age, humans are getting older so that they are more realistic in thoughts and actions. Fantasizing is generally linked to psychopathology and maladaptive coping strategies (Bacon & Charlesford, 2018).

The study outcomes track an initial suggestion of the possible role of spiritual dimensions in expecting self-reported empathy levels among Muslim pre-service teachers and the usefulness of combining spiritual dimensions and assessment in university students' educational curricula. A

Commented [A11]: Why does this happen? State the reason and strengthen it with the results of the journal

possible suggestion for lecturer in education field might therefore be to introduce spirituality as a significant issue in psychological education at the starting of the educational course.

Commented [A12]: How? What advice can be given so that it can be put into practice

In practice, classroom courses and counseling services at universities (Bingham, 2015; Setiyowati et al., 2019; Taufiq & Herdi, 2020; Vescovelli et al., 2017) could be the best educational context in which teacher in training can realize their enhanced spiritual dimension. They need to learn how to manage and use it in overcoming psychological problems. (Harrington & O'Connell, 2016; Kuven & Giske, 2019; Maselli et al., 2019). This means, university students can increase their ability to modulate the cognitive, emotional, and behavioral implications by internalizing the spiritual dimensions within them before becoming teachers who directly interact with students in school.

Commented [A13]: What steps can be taken to increase spirituality and empathy for pre service teachers?

Implications

The main implication of this research is that years of formal education have an impact on empathy and aspects of spirituality (meaning of purpose). So that universities have an essential role in teaching prospective teachers to empathize with their students through learning at universities not only in undergraduate programs but also for professional teacher program after they graduate. In addition, the role of counseling at universities becomes more apparent that the fantasy aspect of empathy naturally declines with age. Besides that, counselors at universities can also make different counseling formulas between men and women, considering that based on this study, men have higher personal distress than women. Another implication is that the spiritual dimensions can be a major force in implementing spiritual counseling at universities, especially in dealing with empathy specifically.

Commented [A14]: The implications described are still only theoretical, how are the benefits of this research, especially practical benefits that can be carried out daily by teachers, counselors?
The implications have not described the results of this study.

Commented [A15]: The fact in Indonesia is that there is a lack of implementation of the counseling role at the university level, how to overcome this?

Limitations

Commented [A16]: This sentence needs to be questioned further:
1. Empirically, counselors do not play a role in universities, how to respond?
2. What are the differences in the counseling formulas between men and women?

Commented [A17]: What are the steps for applying spiritual counseling at universities?

Although Interpersonal Reactivity Index (IRI) is easy to administer and has strong psychometric power such as that tested on Indonesian and international samples. The measurement results are reliable in measuring general empathy for various sample characteristics. Still, they do not specifically describe teacher empathy towards students. It was also generalized that all of the participants in this study were Muslim pre-service teachers from various fields of study. Further research could develop design. Subsequent research can develop counseling strategies at universities based on the information from this study, in order to obtain results of increasing spirituality and empathy effectively by considering the many factors that have been studied.

CONCLUSION

This study examined the influence of spiritual dimensions on empathy for Muslim pre-service teachers by considering the aspects of age, gender, and years of formal education. This study has shown that there is no single dimension of spirituality that is not related to empathy. Instead, the results of this study indicate that spirituality has a significant influence in determining one's empathy. Besides, the age factor affects only one dimension, fantasy, while the gender factor affects two dimensions: fantasy and personal distress. Other dimensions of both empathy and spirituality are not influenced by gender and age. On the other hand, years of formal education factor affects both of these variables. On the other hand, years of formal education affects the increase in all dimensions of the empathy variable and the meaning of purpose dimension in the spirituality variable. The study contributes to our understanding of the importance of spirituality built-in being developed through universities to help students overcome psychological problems and increase their empathy.

REFERENCES

Commented [A18]: For demographics that are not discussed in more detail in the discussion section, please clarify more so that this research is new.

Commented [A19]: 1. For the title/publisher/name of the journal in Indonesian to be translated into English
2. There are still a lot of writing references that don't match with APA
3. Many citations used are not appropriate in explaining the sentence

- Ardenghi, S., Rampoldi, G., Bani, M., & Strepparava, M. G. (2020). Attachment styles as predictors of self-reported empathy in medical students during pre-clinical years. *Patient Education and Counseling*, *103*(5), 965–970. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pec.2019.11.004>
- Babarin, O. (1993). Coping and Resilience: Exploring the Inner Lives of African American Children. *Journal of Black Psychology* *4*(19): 478-492.
- Bacon, A. M., & Charlesford, J. J. (2018). Investigating the association between fantasy proneness and emotional distress: the mediating role of cognitive coping strategies. *Personality and Individual Differences*.
<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S019188691830391X>
- Bingham, R. P. (2015). The role of university and college counseling centers in advancing the professionalization of psychology. *Am Psychol*, *70*(8), 792–796.
<https://doi.org/10.1037/a0039638>.
- Can Gür, G., & Yilmaz, E. (2020). The effects of mindfulness-based empathy training on empathy and aged discrimination in nursing students: A randomised controlled trial. *Complementary Therapies in Clinical Practice*, *39*, 101140.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ctcp.2020.101140>
- Chiang, Y. C., Lee, H. C., Chu, T. L., Han, C. Y., & ... (2020). A spiritual education course to enhance nursing students' spiritual competencies. *Nurse Education in ...*
<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1471595320309938>
- Cohen, J. (1977). *Statistical Power Analysis for the Behavioral Sciences*. Academic Press.
https://books.google.co.id/books?hl=id&lr=&id=rEe0BQAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&ots=swTYJyOPn8&sig=RIaPjoQH3Mhn9IjyAalX6KPoehQ&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q&f=false
- Corte, K. De, BUYSSE, A., VERHOFSTADT, L. L., & ROEYERS, H. (2007). Measuring

- Empathic Tendencies: Reliability and Validity of The Dutch Version of The Interpersonal Reactivity Index. *Psychologica Belgica*, 235–260. <https://doi.org/10.5334/pb-47-4-235>
- Counted, V., Possamai, A., & Meade, T. (2018). Relational spirituality and quality of life 2007 to 2017: An integrative research review. *Health and Quality of Life Outcomes*, 16(1), 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12955-018-0895-x>
- Cruz, J. P., Alshammari, F., Alotaibi, K. A., & Colet, P. C. (2017). Spirituality and spiritual care perspectives among baccalaureate nursing students in Saudi Arabia: A cross-sectional study. *Nurse Education Today*, 49. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nedt.2016.11.027>
- Davis, M. H. (1980). Measure: INTERPERSONAL REACTIVITY INDEX (IRI) - measures empathy. *JSAS Catalog of Selected Documents in Psychology*, 10(1980), 85.
- DePue, M. K., & Lambie, G. W. (2014). Impact of a university-based practicum experience on counseling students' levels of empathy and assessed counseling competencies. *Counseling Outcome Research* <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/2150137814548509>
- Dose, A. M., Leonard, B., McAlpine, C. P., & Kreitzer, M. J. (2014). The meaning of spirituality at the end of life. *Journal of Hospice and Palliative Nursing*, 16(3), 158–164. <https://doi.org/10.1097/NJH.0000000000000041>
- Edwards, A., Pang, N., Shiu, V., & Chan, C. (2010). Review: The understanding of spirituality and the potential role of spiritual care in end-of-life and palliative care: A meta-study of qualitative research. *Palliative Medicine*, 24(8), 753–770. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0269216310375860>
- Espejo-Siles, R., Zych, I., Farrington, D. P., & Llorent, V. J. (2020). Moral disengagement, victimization, empathy, social and emotional competencies as predictors of violence in children and adolescents. *Children and Youth Services Review*, 118(May), 105337.

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chilyouth.2020.105337>

~~Fatimah, S. (2020). Mahasiswa Bosan Kuliah Daring, Kemendikbud: Lebih Baik Tak Mengeluh. *Detiknews*. <https://news.detik.com/berita-jawa-barat/d-5124745/mahasiswa-bosan-kuliah-daring-kemendikbud-lebih-baik-tak-mengeluh>~~

Feizi, S., Nasiri, M., Bahadori, H., Hosseini Amiri, M., & Mirhosseini, H. (2020). The relationship between spiritual well-being and happiness among healthcare students: Application of the spiritual health questionnaire for the Iranian population. *Heliyon*, 6(11), e05448. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2020.e05448>

Fitriyah, F. K., & Djazilan, M. S. (2020). Kontekstualisasi Nilai Pendidikan Karakter dalam Sirah Nabawiyah. *Journal of Islamic Civilization*, 2(2), 80–89. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.33086/jic.v2i2.1734>

Fitriyah, F. K., Saputra, N., Dellarosa, M., & Afridah, W. (2020). Does spirituality correlate with students' empathy during covid-19 pandemic? the case study of Indonesian students. *Couns-Edu: The International Journal of Counseling and Education*, 5(3). <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.23916/0020200527820>

Frida, A., Novieastari, E., & Nuraini, T. (2019). Perception on spiritual care: Comparison of the nursing students of public university and religious-based university. *Enfermeria Clinica*. <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1130862119301007>

Gilet, A. L., Mella, N., Studer, J., Griihn, D., & Labouvie-Vief, G. (2013). Assessing dispositional empathy in Adults: A french validation of the interpersonal reactivity index (IRI). *Canadian Journal of Behavioural Science*, 45(1), 42–48. <https://doi.org/10.1037/a0030425>

Giordano, A. L., Prosek, E. A., & Lankford, C. T. (2014). Predicting Empathy: The Role of Religion and Spirituality. *Journal of Professional Counseling: Practice, Theory &*

Research, 41(2), 53–66. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15566382.2014.12033938>

Gomez, R., & Fisher, J. W. (2005). The spiritual well-being questionnaire: Testing for model applicability, measurement and structural equivalencies, and latent mean differences across gender. *Personality and Individual Differences*.

<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S019188690500187X>

Hall, J. K., & Smotrova, T. (2013). Teacher self-talk: Interactional resource for managing instruction and eliciting empathy. *Journal of Pragmatics*, 47(1), 75–92.

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pragma.2012.11.017>

Hardy, S. A., Walker, L. J., Rackham, D. D., & Olsen, J. A. (2012). Religiosity and adolescent empathy and aggression: The mediating role of moral identity. *Psychology of Religion and Spirituality*, 4(3), 237–248. <https://doi.org/10.1037/a0027566>

Harrington, B., & O’Connell, M. (2016). Video games as virtual teachers: Prosocial video game use by children and adolescents from different socioeconomic groups is associated with increased empathy and prosocial behaviour. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 63, 650–658.

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2016.05.062>

Hefli, R. (2011). Integrating religion and spirituality into mental health care, psychiatry and psychotherapy. *Religions*, 2(4), 611–627. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel2040611>

Heppner, P. P. (2008). Expanding the Conceptualization and Measurement of Applied Problem Solving and Coping: From Stages to Dimensions to the Almost Forgotten Cultural Context.

American Psychologist, 63(8), 805–816. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0003-066X.63.8.805>

Hotoleanu, C., & Dumitrascu, D. L. (2016). The role of spirituality in female and male medical patients. *Journal of Psychosomatic Research*, 85, 66.

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpsychores.2016.03.162>

Howden, J. W. (1992). *Development and Psychometric Characteristics of The Spiritual*

Assesment Scale (Issue December). TEXAS WOMAN'S UNIVERSITY.

- Jaber, L. Z., Southerland, S., & Dake, F. (2018). Cultivating epistemic empathy in preservice teacher education. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 72*, 13–23.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2018.02.009>
- Jannah, Z., Fauziah, N., Ningsih, T. N., Kusumaning, R. F., Suryadi, D. A., Putri, R., Budiarti, N., & Fitriyah, F. K. (2021). *Planetarium Glass Based on Augmented Reality to Improve Science Literacy Knowledge in Madura Primary Schools. 3*(1), 19–29.
- Johnson, K. S., Tulskey, J. A., Hays, J. C., Arnold, R. M., Olsen, M. K., Lindquist, J. H., & Steinhauer, K. E. (2011). Which domains of spirituality are associated with anxiety and depression in patients with advanced illness? *Journal of General Internal Medicine, 26*(7), 751–758. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11606-011-1656-2>
- Kamas, L., & Preston, A. (2020). Empathy, gender, and prosocial behavior. *Journal of Behavioral and Experimental Economics*.
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socec.2020.101654>
- Kurniasih, V. W., Fitriyah, F. K., Hidayat, M. T., & Sunanto. (2020). Hubungan Pemahaman Diri Terhadap Rasa Tangung Jawab: Sebuah Survey pada Anak Usia Dini di Kota Surabaya. *Child Education Journal, 2*(2), 98–105. <https://doi.org/10.33086/cej.v2i2.1672>
- Kusumaning Ayu, R. F., Puspita Sari, S., Yunarti Setiawan, B., & Khoirul Fitriyah, F. (2019). Meningkatkan Kemampuan Berbahasa Daerah Melalui Cerita Rakyat Digital pada Siswa Sekolah Dasar: Sebuah Studi Pengembangan. *Child Education Journal, 1*(2), 65–72.
<https://doi.org/10.33086/cej.v1i2.1356>
- Kuven, B. M., & Giske, T. (2019). Talking about spiritual matters: First year nursing students' experiences of an assignment on spiritual conversations. *Nurse Education Today, 75*, 53–57. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nedt.2019.01.012>

- Lal, A., Tharyan, A., & Tharyan, P. (2020). The prevalence, determinants and the role of empathy and religious or spiritual beliefs on job stress, job satisfaction, coping, burnout, and mental health in medical and surgical faculty of a teaching hospital: A cross-sectional survey. *Revue de Medecine Interne*, *41*(4), 232–240.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.revmed.2019.12.005>
- Lal, Amos, Sahu, K. K., & Mishra, A. K. (2020). Can Foundational Spiritual and Religious Beliefs Be Protective Against Burnout? *American Journal of Medicine*, *133*(8), e441.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.amjmed.2020.02.026>
- Luna, M. J., Ameli, R., Sinaii, N., Cheringal, J., & ... (2018). Gender Differences in Psycho-Social-Spiritual Aspects of Healing. *Journal of Pain and ...*, *56*(6).
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpainsymman.2018.10.426>
- Maselli, M., Gobbi, E., & Carraro, A. (2019). Effectiveness of individual counseling and activity monitors to promote physical activity among university students. *J Sports Med Phys Fitness*, *59*(1), 132–140. <https://doi.org/10.23736/S0022-4707.17.07981-6>
- Mohan, D. L., & Uys, K. (2006). Towards living with meaning and purpose: Spiritual perspectives of people at work. *SA Journal of Industrial Psychology*, *32*(1), 53–59.
<https://doi.org/10.4102/sajip.v32i1.228>
- Moloney, S., & Gair, S. (2015). Empathy and spiritual care in midwifery practice: Contributing to women’s enhanced birth experiences. *Women and Birth*, *28*(4), 323–328.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wombi.2015.04.009>
- Murphy, B. A., Costello, T. H., Watts, A. L., Cheong, Y. F., Berg, J. M., & Lilienfeld, S. O. (2020). Strengths and Weaknesses of Two Empathy Measures: A Comparison of the Measurement Precision, Construct Validity, and Incremental Validity of Two Multidimensional Indices. *Assessment*, *27*(2), 246–260.

<https://doi.org/10.1177/1073191118777636>

Nardha, R. (2020). Uneg-uneg Mahasiswa soal Biaya Kuliah yang “Mencekik” Kala Pandemi Corona. *Detiknews*. <https://news.detik.com/berita/d-5124915/uneg-uneg-mahasiswa-soal-biaya-kuliah-yang-mencekik-kala-pandemi-corona>

Ngussa, B. M., Fitriyah, F. K., & Diningrat, S. W. M. (2021). Correlation Between Facebook Use, Mental Health And Learning Engagement: A Case Of Universities In Surabaya City, Indonesia. *Turkish Online Journal of Distance Education*, 22(1), 229–245.
<https://doi.org/10.17718/TOJDE.849912>

Palmer Kelly, E., Paredes, A. Z., Tsilimigras, D. I., Hyer, J. M., & Pawlik, T. M. (2020). The role of religion and spirituality in cancer care: An umbrella review of the literature. *Surgical Oncology*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.suronc.2020.05.004>

Peng, H., & Chen, M. (2014). The study of spirituality , work value and career decision-making between Christian and Non-Christian college students. *The Journal of Happiness & Well-Being*, 2(1), 63–74.

Prosek, E. A., Giordano, A. L., Woehler, E. S., & ... (2020). The Experience of Religion and Spirituality Among College Students Who Use Illicit Substances. *Counseling and*
<https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/cvj.12137>

Rogers, C. R. (1956). The Necessary and Sufficient Conditions of Therapeutic Personality Change. *Journal of Consulting Psychology*, 21, 95–103.

Ross, L., McSherry, W., Giske, T., van Leeuwen, R., & ... (2018). Nursing and midwifery students’ perceptions of spirituality, spiritual care, and spiritual care competency: A prospective, longitudinal, correlational European study. *Nurse Education ...*, 67.
<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0260691718301941>

Scocco, P., Aliverti, E., Toffol, E., Andretta, G., & Capizzi, G. (2020). Empathy profiles differ

- by gender in people who have and have not attempted suicide. *Journal of Affective Disorders Reports*, 2(August), 100024. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jadr.2020.100024>
- Setiyowati, A. J., Pali, M., Wiyono, B. B., & Triyono, T. (2019). Structural model of counseling competence. *Cakrawala Pendidikan*, 38(1), 45–62. <https://doi.org/10.21831/cp.v38i1.21509>
- Šilingienė, V., & Škėrienė, S. (2015). Expression of Leaders' Spiritual Intelligence in a Context of Service Organizations: A Gender Approach. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 213, 758–763. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.11.467>
- Smith, M. R., & Gordon, R. (2005). College Students' Attitudes toward Lesbians and Gay Men: A half-decade Follow-up and the Insignificance of Spirituality. *College Students' Attitudes*. <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED490395.pdf>
- Spenser, K., Bull, R., Betts, L., & Winder, B. (2020). Underpinning prosociality: Age related performance in theory of mind, empathic understanding, and moral reasoning. *Cognitive Development*, 56. <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0885201420300824>
- Stewart, C., & Lawrence, S. (2020). A multi-dimensional exploration of spirituality to empathy. *Journal of Spirituality in Mental Health*, 00(00), 1–24. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19349637.2020.1732266>
- Suryandari, K. C., Sajidan, Rahardjo, S. B., Zuhdan Kun, P., & Fatimah, S. (2016). PROJECT-BASED SCIENCE LEARNING AND PRE-SERVICE TEACHERS' SCIENCE LITERACY SKILL AND CREATIVE THINKING. *Cakrawala Pendidikan*, 345–355.
- Tabachnick, B. G., & Fidell, L. S. (2000). *Computer-Assisted Research Design and Analysis*. Allyn & Bacon, Inc. <https://dl.acm.org/doi/book/10.5555/556711>
- Tantular, M. (2009). *Kakawin Sutasoma* (D. W. R. Mastuti & H. Bramantyo (Eds.); Pertama). Komunitas Bambu.
- Taufiq, A., & Herdi, H. (2020). Does the number of supervised counseling practice experiences

make difference in the wisdom of pre-service counselors? *Cakrawala Pendidikan*, 39(1), 156–167. <https://doi.org/10.21831/cp.v39i1.28870>

Vescovelli, F., Melani, P., Ruini, C., Ricci Bitti, P. E., & Monti, F. (2017). University counseling service for improving students' mental health. *Psychological Services*, 14(4), 470–480. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1037/ser0000166>

WHO. (2021). *Management of substance abuse*. World Health Organization. https://www.who.int/substance_abuse/research_tools/translation/en/

Wollacott, M. H., Kason, Y., & Park, R. D. (2020). Investigation of the phenomenology, physiology and impact of spiritually transformative experiences – kundalini awakening. *Explore*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.explore.2020.07.005>

Response to reviewers

Reviewer #1

Introduction:

(A1) The reference used from Jannah and Kusumaning does not accurately describe online learning

Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the positive comments. We have revised it in the line 31-33.

(A2) It is advisable to cite based on reputable international journals (eg Scopus) for the last 10 years.

Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the positive comments. We have revised it in the whole of manuscript.

(A3) Same as above, Should cite based on reputable international journals (eg: Scopus) for the last 10 years

Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the positive comments. We have revised it in the whole of manuscript.

(A4) Add the reason why only revealing the demographics of the respondents, namely gender and age. So it is important to disclose in this study.

Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the positive comments. We have revised it in the line 83-88.

Add research hypothesis

Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the positive comments. We have added the hypothesis in the line 74-77.

Methods:

(A5) In the research method, important points are made:

Research Design

Participants

Procedure

Data Collection

Data analysis.

Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the positive suggestions. We have revised in the line 90-140.

(A6) Add how the results of the validity and reliability test of the construct on the spirituality instrument

Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the positive comments. We have revised in the line 108-134.

(A7) Add how the results of the validity and reliability test of the construct on the empathy instrument

Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the positive comments. We have revised in the line 126-134.

Data analysis:

(A8) Data analysis must refer to the research hypothesis

Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the positive comments. We have revised in the line 136-139.

Discussion:

(A9) Add the reasons from the results of this study that there is no difference in the spiritual dimension and gender? Why?

Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the positive suggestions. We have revised in the line 187-199.

And the reason why the results of this study show that only fantasy is correlated with age.

Our response: Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the positive suggestions. We have revised in the line 201-211.

(A10) This section should explain, why are male pre service teachers more empathy than women?

Our response: Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the positive question. We have revised in the line 201-208.

(A11) Why does this happen? State the reason and strengthen it with the results of the journal.

Our response: Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the positive question. We have revised in the line 201-208.

(A12) How? What advice can be given so that it can be put into practice

Our response: Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the positive question. We have revised in the line 201-208.

(A13) What steps can be taken to increase spirituality and empathy for pre service teachers?

Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the positive suggestion. We have revised in the line 231-257.

Implication

(A14) The implications described are still only theoretical, how are the benefits of this research, especially practical benefits that can be carried out daily by teachers, counselors?

The implications have not described the results of this study.

Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the positive suggestion. We have revised in the line 231-257.

(A15) The fact in Indonesia is that there is a lack of implementation of the counseling role at the university level, how to overcome this?

Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the positive suggestion. We have revised in the line 231-257.

(A16) This sentence needs to be questioned further:

1. Empirically, counselors do not play a role in universities, how to respond?
2. What are the differences in the counseling formulas between men and women?

Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the positive suggestion. We have revised in the line 231-257.

(A17) What are the steps for applying spiritual counseling at universities?

Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the positive suggestion. We have revised in the line 250-257.

Conclusion

(A18) For demographics that are not discussed in more detail in the discussion section, please clarify more so that this research is new.

Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the positive suggestion. We have revised in the line 246-251.

References

(A19)

1. For the title/publisher/name of the journal in Indonesian to be translated into English
2. There are still a lot of writing references that don't match with APA
3. Many citations used are not appropriate in explaining the sentence

Our response: The authors thank the reviewer for the suggestion. The references have been updated.



Nurussakinah Daulay <nurussakinah@uinsu.ac.id>

[IGCJ] Article Review Acknowledgement

1 pesan

IGC Journal <igcjournal@gmail.com>

26 Juni 2021 12.12

Kepada: Nurussakinah Daulay <nurussakinah@uinsu.ac.id>

Dear Dr. Nurussakinah Daulay, M.Psi, Psikolog,

Thank you very much for completing the review of the submission, "A Multi-Dimensional Exploration of Spirituality to Empathy Among Indonesian Muslim Pre-Service Teachers," for Islamic Guidance and Counseling Journal. We appreciate your contribution to the quality of the work that we publish.

We are honored to have you as a reviewer in our journal. Please find attached the online certificate of appreciation for your contribution to the journal. We also have added your name in the Journal Reviewer Pool. <http://journal.iainnumetrolampung.ac.id/index.php/igcj/PeerReviewers>

The IGCJ also has been listed in publons, so you can add this review in your publons profile. You should forward this acknowledgement to reviews@publons.com to add this record. We also would like to invite you to Endorse the journal in Publons. Please visit the link for more information about publons: <https://journal.iainnumetrolampung.ac.id/index.php/igcj/forreviewers>

Best wishes,

Aprezo Pardodi Maba, M.Pd | aprezopm@gmail.com

Editor in Chief



Nurussakinah Daulay.png

202K



THE ISLAMIC GUIDANCE AND COUNSELING JOURNAL

Certificate of Appreciation - 2021

Dr. Nurussakinah Daulay, M.Psi, Psikolog,

Universitas Islam Negeri Sumatera Utara Medan, Indonesia

In recognition of timely, thoughtful and constructive reviews that substantially shaped the development of manuscripts submitted to the journal.



Dr. Mispani, M.Pd.I

Rector of Institut Agama Islam Ma'arif NU (IAIMNU) Metro Lampung (Publisher)

